# JOURNAL OF

# EDUCATIONAL ACTION RESEARCH



CENTRE FOR EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH & DEVELOPMENT Paro College of Education, Paro BHUTAN

> PO Box. 1245 Tel: +975-8-272011/271620, Fax: +975-8-271917 www.pce.edu.bt

Printed: KUENSEL Corporation Ltd., 2015, Thimphu

VOLUME 1, NUMBER -1

NOVEMBER 2015

ISSN: 2413 - 5992

Journal of Educatioinal

Action

Researc

November 2015

*Journal of Educational Action Research (JEAR)* CERD Vol. 1, No. 1, November 2015

# Dedicated to His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo on the occassion of His 60<sup>th</sup> Birth Anniversary

# JOURNAL OF EDUCATIONAL ACTION RESEARCH

#### **Editor-in-Chief**

Kezang Sherab, PhD Dean, Research & Industrial Linkages, CERD, PCE

### Editors

1. Tsering Yangzome Nidup (English), CERD

2. Pema Dendup (Dzongkha), Assistant Professor, PCE

# **Production Editors**

1. Ramesh Thapa, Research Officer, CERD

2. Bishnu Pradhan, Adm. Asst. CERD

# Reviewers

Timothy Bedford, PhD, Finland Adele Nye, PhD, Australia Kezang Sherab, PhD, Bhutan Karen Peterson, PhD, Denmark Gembo Tshering, PhD, Bhutan

The *Journal of Educational Action Research (JEAR)* is published once a year in the Autumn Semester by the Centre for Educational Research and Development, Paro College of Education, Royal University of Bhutan. The *JEAR* aspires to develop a strong educational research and scholarship culture, through which a systematic, collaborative and participatory process of inquiry address areas of concern facing education today. This would not only help provide technical skills and specialized knowledge, but also bring about positive changes within the classroom, schools or the community at large. The journal welcomes contributions from researchers and scholars who work in the field of action research and related activities in education. The *JEAR* utilizes a blind peer review process of its manuscript and involves both national and external reviewers.

# November 2015

© Center for Educational Research and Development

ISSN: 2413 - 5992

#### **Editorial Correspondances**

Any inquiries related to JEAR, including manuscripts for submission, together with an electronic copy of the article in MS Word format should be addressed to: the Dean Research and Industrial Linkages (Dr. Kezang Sherab), Editor in Chief at **kezangsherab.pce@rub.edu.bt**, M/s Tsering Y. Nidup (Editor) at **tseringynidup.pce@rub.edu.bt** or Ramesh Thapa, Production Editor at **rameshthapa.pce@rub.edu.bt**. The manuscript must be submitted based on the JEAR guidelines for manuscript.

# JOURNAL OF EDUCATIONIAL ACTION RESEARCH

Volume 1, Number 1 Number 2015

# CONTENT

Strategies for encouraging responsible sexual behavior amongst college youth: An action research case study at the Paro College of Education <i>Amina Gurung and Dechen Tshomo</i>	1 - 23
Cultivating and improving classroom reinforcement strategies to optimise pre-service student teachers' learning <i>Ugyen Tshomo and Lhaden</i>	24 - 44
ૹ૾ૣૼૼૼૼૼ૱ૡ૱ૻૣૻૡૼૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡૡ	45 - 59
A Sample Action Research Proposal - Ways to Actively Engage Bhutanese Pre-Service Student Teachers in their Curriculum Studies Classes: Plans for an Action Research Case Study <i>Kezang Sherab</i>	60 - 69
JEAR: Guidelines for Manuscript	70- 71

\*\*\*

# Strategies for encouraging responsible sexual behavior amongst college youth: An action research case study at the Paro College of Education

Amina Gurung<sup>1</sup> and Dechen Tshomo<sup>2</sup>

The purpose of this paper is to investigate and examine the existence of irresponsible sexual behavior amongst the students of the Paro College of Education (PCE), with a further aim to recognize and resolve issues arising out of involvement in irresponsible sexual behavior. Action research as a method of critical inquiry was used to conduct a three-phase study involving 91 student teachers of the College. A reconnaissance phase explored the prevalence of irresponsible sexual behavior. In the second phase, an intervention was implemented where the research participants were given opportunities to openly discuss and understand the complexities of irresponsible sexual behavior. A third phase of the research evaluated the extent to which change had occurred. Findings from the baseline study confirmed the prevalence of irresponsible sexual behavior. The baseline data showed that while student teachers perceived that they had adequate knowledge about issues relating to sex, internalization of the knowledge and safe sex practices were areas that needed adequate interventions. Two intervention strategies employed showed positive signs of understanding complex issues related to irresponsible sexual behavior. Evidence from the post intervention data indicated that these groups of student teachers were better able to recognize and understand relationship and sexual issues. In summary, the intervention did change the perception of student teachers towards becoming responsible sexual partners, but the study is limited by its inability to gauge internalisation of learning and study its implementation. For this to occur, another cycle of action research is required.

Key words- Responsible Sexual Behavior, Action Research, College Youth

# Introduction

This action research on sexual behavior amongst college youth was undertaken at the PCE in the fall semester of 2014. The purpose of this inquiry was to investigate and improve the prevalence of responsible sexual behavior amongst the youth of the college. According to Hine (2013, p.151), this kind of critical research is a process of systematic inquiry that seeks to improve social issues affecting the lives of everyday people. He further goes on to cite Kemmis and McTaggart and states that action research is a:

form of collective reflective enquiry undertaken by participants in social situations in order to improve the rationality and justice of their own social or educational practices, as well as their understanding of these practices and the situations in which these practices are carried out. (Hine, 2013, p.151)

<sup>1.</sup> Lecturer, Paro College of Education. E-mail: aminagurung.pce@rub.edu.bt

<sup>2.</sup> Senior Lecturer, Paro College of Education. E-mail: dechentshomo.pce@rub.edu.bt

When the research was being carried out, the college had 1084 full time and 406 part time students (www.pce.edu.bt). Besides our regular teaching load, we were involved then in the College as Student Support Unit (SSU) provosts of the girls' hostel, and coordinators for the Women and Children Club. All these responsibilities demanded an empathetic and an understanding approach to resolving sexual behavior issues of our students time and again. Hence, this action research was a systematic approach to carrying out our 'mentoring' and 'teaching' tasks in a manner that was helpful to our students. Faure (cited in Gibbons, 2013, p.1) states, "mentoring is a supportive learning relationship between a caring individual who shares knowledge, experience and wisdom with another individual who is ready and willing to benefit from this exchange". Therefore, these experiences and responsibilities demanded of us to replace the teacher cloak and look for new ways of thinking and doing our work. It provoked an empathetic and holistic approach to reflect on the existing problems and helped us improve our practice while dealing with college youth's sexual behavior. Moreover, it challenged our current beliefs and assumptions and helped us to come up with informed ways to future action.

Consequently in this paper, we take a reflective approach to reflect on our own practice to critically examine the problem and seek interventions that will help reduce or solve the problem discussed. We begin with personal stories of lived experiences and end with reflections and recommendations for future direction.

# **Personal Stories**

The following personal stories illustrate the situation that prompted us to carry out this action research.

#### Personal Anecdote- Researcher 1

I have taught young adolescents for twelve years, first in a higher secondary school and now in an education college. In these twelve years of working with the youth, I have observed that there is one common thing young adolescents are interested in, that is getting into an intimate relationship. While seeking intimacy may not be wrong or harmful, getting intimate with a wrong or an unprepared partner would have negative implications. As a teacher and mentor, one of the main concerns I had was the risky sexual relationship of young people. In my years of teaching in different educational institutions and serving as the ladies' provost, I have encountered several issues connected to irresponsible sexual behavior. Sometimes helping someone take ownership of an abandoned child, sometimes counseling someone who was in the eighth month of her pregnancy and whose husband was in a relationship with another girl in the same college. And, sometimes helping a girl come out of an abusive relationship, sometimes advising someone who got involved with a married man who along with his wife later abused and beat her. These incidences have made me seriously think about my roles and responsibilities as a trainer, a teacher, a mentor and a guide.

# Personal Anecdote- Researcher 2

Having worked in the college for the last eight years has seriously made me reflect on some of the youth issues that have been going on in the college. Some of the pertinent issues are open display of affection among men and women, pregnancy cases and extra marital affairs.

Journal of Educational Action Research

Prevalence of pregnancy cases, open display of affection and extra marital affairs are all evidence based and therefore I would like to find out the possible reasons for the student teachers' actions. Whatever the situations are, there have been huge repercussions like– when pregnant student teachers are not able to carry out the class activities properly, nor are they able to participate in co-curricular activities and some even having to leave the college. Open displays of affection and extra marital affairs are least expected of student teachers as they are expected to become role models for the school students in the future. However, these activities mar the reputation and the performance of the individuals and the College at large. Having heard and witnessed the above issues, me as the SSU coordinator then, had even carried out 'men talk' and 'women talk' so as to make the student teachers understand the situation that they are in and also to help them become more responsible. Despite carrying out such initiatives, we still witnessed and heard similar issues which made me assume that irresponsible sexual behavior was rampant amongst the youths at the Paro College of Education.

# Youth & sexual behavior in Bhutan

While there is a lack of research concerning youth sexual relationship and behavior especially in the context of higher education institutes in Bhutan, evidences suggest increasing incidences of irresponsible sexual behavior amongst young people, resulting in unplanned pregnancies, relationship conflict, STIs, emotional and psychological stress and sometimes suicide. Youth constitute more than 20% of the total population in Bhutan (UNDP, 2013), and while young people in Bhutan are emphasized as the most important priority at all levels of the society for a sustainable future, studies confirm the status of youth to be quite adverse. The National STIs and HIV/AIDS control program (NACP) of the Department of Health (2014, p. 2) states that, "sexually transmitted infections (STIs) including HIV present a serious challenge to the health and well-being of Bhutan". The report further states, "while HIV prevalence remains low, STI prevalence and incidence are worryingly and unacceptably high" (p. 2). The Bhutan Multiple Indicator Survey's (BMIS, 2010) and the Health Thematic Analysis (HTA, 2012) found low use of contraceptives particularly among young, unmarried women (p. 19). The World Bank report on HIV/AIDS in Bhutan (2012) reported that one fifth of all married people have engaged in extramarital sex in the last year, and 14% of unmarried people had sex in the last year. Rates were considerably higher among urban males (43 percent had extramarital sex in the last year, and 42 percent of urban single men had premarital sex in the last year). The same report also highlighted that Bhutan had "less stringent sexual norms for both men and women as compared to other South Asian countries". Studies conducted on adolescent health found that, "in comparison to other Asian countries, the Bhutanese society has a relatively open approach to sex and sexuality with less stringent practices and views about sexuality for both men and women. Premarital sex is not taboo in many rural communities with an early onset of sexual activity (especially in rural areas) occurring for some boys and girls increasing their risk of sexually transmitted diseases." (National Youth Policy, 2010). A recent study conducted by Norbu, Mukhia, and Tshokey (2013) assessed local knowledge on STIs and sexual risk behavior in two rural districts of Bhutan: Gasa and Zhemgang. The study found that "one in three persons practiced risky sexual behavior, higher in men. Condom use was low. There was no reduction of risky sexual behavior with increasing level of knowledge indicating that increasing level of knowledge does not necessarily reduce risky sexual behavior" (p. 1).

# Sexual behavior amongst college students

The review of literature related to the prevalence of responsible sexual behavior amongst youth in the universities yielded some interesting but disturbing results. In the international context, several studies, (Omoteso, 2006; Abdullahi & Umar, 2013a; Thompson & Johnson, n.d; Berne & Huberman, 1999; Cross & Morgan, n.d.) have shown that there was a high prevalence of free sex and sexual activities particularly in the context of higher learning institutes like the universities. For instance, in Nigeria, research has shown that (Warner, as cited in Abdullahi & Umar 2013, p. 41b) "sex before marriage is seen as normal and a pleasurable satisfaction which young adults experience." They go on to say that "the university environment allows freer sexual activities and this is against moral values of the community. It is for this perhaps that the University is witnessing the prevalence of pre-marital sex, homosexuals, rape, STIs and incidences of abortion in the campus" (p. 41).

Odoemelan (cited in Abdullahi & Umar, 2013a, p. 41) observed that inappropriate sexual behaviors and consequences of such behaviors constitute enormous problems. The report further goes on to say that "once in school, college or universities, students are cut off from family's restriction and support" and that "college life neither understands nor supports the value of chastity." Hence for the students in higher learning institutions "sex is reduced to an easy source of pleasure and totally divorced from love and marriage" (Meekers, 1994 & Orubuloye et al. 1997 cited in Abdullahi & Umar 2013, p. 41). Further, Peterson (1999 cited in Cross & Morgan, n.d., p. 4) reveals, "living in the era of AIDS education, the lesson students learned was that sexual intercourse was accepted as long as they used a condom."

In another study by Abdullahi and Umar (2013b) economic reasons were the most significant factors for the existence of pre-marital sex among students on campus. Further, their study also found that "girls engage in pre-marital sex to please their boyfriends and assure him of her love" (p. 43). In the same study by Abdullahi and Umar (2013b) the male FGD (focus group discussion) members generally opined that boys think of sex first, before love and most of them consider female students who engage in pre-marital sex for the sake of love as prostitutes (p. 48).

Omoteso (2006) states that the family background has a significant influence on young people's sexual behavior. Meekers and Calve (1997); Luke (2001); Macphail and Campbell (2001) as cited in Ometeso (2006) found that "in many countries, youngwomen lacking opportunities and from poor family background seek support from men trading sex and thus risk HIV infection and other STIs for security. Young women sometimes enter into relationship with older men called "sugar daddies" in sub-Saharan Africa who pay their school fees, buy them gifts and offer inducements" (p. 130).

In Bhutan, a report by the National HIV/AIDS and STI Prevention and Control Program (NACP), Ministry of Health in Bhutan, (2014) state that "similar to many countries in the region, majority (87%) of the PLHIV (people living with HIV) are within the productive age group of 20-49 years with a significant bearing on the social and economic development of the country" (p. 2). In the same report the risk and vulnerability of the country's youth are clearly highlighted. The report states that 60% of the country's population is below 25 years of age, and that there is a high rate of STIs among the general population. There is also a high prevalence of multi-partner sex practices with concurrent sexual relationships and that there is a growing evidence of drug use, unsafe injecting practice, low condom use and high incidence

of STIs. Another study found that (Dorji, 2015, p. 7):

Kissing and hugging among adolescents and youth are becoming acceptable. Extramarital affairs and divorces are on the rise. Night partying at discotheques, drayang and karaoke is common. Young people tend to get boozed at the parties, and under intoxication many of them end up going for unsafe sexual relationships. Staying late night at the parties and drayang has become equivalence of traditional 'nupital visits'. However, these are emerging as risky avenues for unsafe sex and other antisocial behavior.

# **Defining Sexual Responsibility**

The World Health Organization (WHO, 2006, p. 5) defined sexual health as:

A state of physical, emotional, mental and social well-being in relation to sexuality; it is not merely the absence of disease, dysfunction or infirmity. Sexual health requires a positive and respectful approach to sexuality and sexual relationships, as well as the possibility of having pleasurable and safe sexual experiences, free of coercion, discrimination and violence. For sexual health to be attained and maintained, the sexual rights of all persons must be respected, protected and fulfilled.

However, the complexities of the terms related to sexual aspects are also recognized by the same document. The document states that "many terms, such as sex, sexuality and sexual rights" could not be defined and that there has been no subsequent international agreement on the definitions of these terms. One of the complications they cite for example is that in English, the term "sex" is often used to mean "sexual activity" and can cover a range of behaviors. Other languages and cultures use different terms, with slightly different meanings.

Hence, for this research, sexually responsible behavior is defined as that behavior which promotes and respects the different aspects outlined in the WHO definition of sexual health.

# Dealing with youth sexual issues (Designing Interventions)

Pedlow and Carey (2004) argue that while designing interventions, "tailored interventions" are "more efficacious than one-size fits-all approach" to addressing risky sexual behavior in youths. They talk of age-appropriate or developmentally appropriate intervention strategies that can be effective for young people. In the same vein DeLamater, Wagstaff, and Havens (2000) cited in Pedlow and Carey (2004) talk of culturally appropriate STD/AIDS education intervention that can be effective to a particular culture. Further, Cohen (1992 cited in King, 1999, p. 13), states that information is the key to behavioral change, and therefore, the focus should be on increasing awareness. Kalichman (cited in King 1999, p. 14) further goes on to say that one of the interventions can be "strategy" itself by which he says it "is the process itself where emphasis is placed on how the interventions are implemented between participants and group leader". He further mentions that the key elements to consider during interventions "include how to foster trust, build group cohesiveness, and encourage motivation and mutual support among participants and between participants and the facilitator" (p.14).

As observed by Pedlow and Carey (2004), a number of studies on sexual behavior had

carried out different interventions. However, what was interesting was that the interventions differed depending on various factors like culture, gender, time, place of intervention, non-traditional components that appeal to youth (e.g., game show format, panel discussions, exhibitions) and communication skills training among others. Berne and Huberman (1999) for example found that the social philosophies of adolescent sexual and reproductive health that underpin the European countries as "Rights, Responsibilities and Respect" seem to be very effective. They state that:

In these [European] countries, government and society view accurate information and confidential services, not merely as needs, but as rights of adolescents. These rights, in turn, depend upon societal openness and acceptance of adolescent sexuality. In short, the Dutch, the Germans, and the French expend less time and effort trying to *prevent* young people from having sex and more time and effort in *educating* and *empowering* young people to behave responsibly when they decide to have sex. Each of these nations appears to have an unwritten social contract which states, 'We'll respect your rights to independence and privacy; in return,you'll take the steps you need to take to avoid pregnancy, HIV/AIDS, and other sexually transmitted diseases. (p. ix)

Pedlow and Carey (2004) conclude the diversity of the intervention in the following lines:

Intervention content, design, and delivery can be tailored to different populations by addressing specific risk behavior patterns, hypothesized antecedents of risk behavior change, demographic factors, such as gender and ethnicity, the setting in which the intervention will be implemented, and unique determinants of risk for a particular population. (p. 3)

Following the above lines, two intervention strategies were designed to address the issues that came from the baseline analysis. These interventions were Panel Discussion and an Exhibition on Child Development.

Though studies conducted on sexual health in Bhutan state the openness and lesser rigid sexual norms in the country as compared to other South Asian Nations (World Bank, 2012), in the context of an education college, where a more academic behavior is expected, the focus of the two interventions were mainly on providing information and new facts about sexual health and the consequences of irresponsible sexual behavior. Studies of this kind have not been conducted in the context of the university in Bhutan; hence, our main intention was on value identification of the consequences of youth sexual problems from different angles, keeping in mind the cultural, moral and educational sensitivities of the college. The focus of our interventions was to provide correct sexual knowledge, create positive sex ideas, and practice safe sex behavior.

Therefore, this action research aimed to answer the following research question.

What can we do to encourage responsible sexual behavior amongst the youth of the Paro college of Education?

# **Action Research phases**

For this action research, Cardno and Reynolds's (2008) action research process model (see Figure 1) was used. This process model according to Cardno and Reynolds (2008) "involves reconnaissance, intervention and evaluation phases underpinned by principles of collaboration and critique. The collaboration extends to the joint planning and implementation of the project" (p. 212).



Figure 1. Action Research Phases, Cardno and Reynolds, 2008, p.212

Based on our personal experiences and a thorough literature review, we identified the prevalence of irresponsible sexual behavior in the college. Therefore, in the reconnaissance phase, a survey questionnaire comprising of three constructs and 34 items (see Appendix 1) were employed on 91 final year student participants. Based on the findings of the baseline data, in the intervention phase, two intervention strategies (Child development exhibition and Panel Discussion) were implemented in the fall semester of 2014. This was the second phase of the AR process. The first intervention (Child development exhibition) was employed for 40 minutes and the second intervention (Panel Discussion) was employed for 3 hours (120 minutes). Both the interventions were employed soon after one another. Questionnaires with open-ended questions (Post Intervention tool) were handed over to the participants before the intervention and they were asked to fill it up and return to us as soon as the intervention was over.

# Addressing Ethical Issues

The participants were clearly explained the objective of the study verbally in the classes and the club before the implementation of the baseline tool as well as the interventions. Further the participants also filled up a written consent which was read and signed by each participant. Confidentiality was maintained while coding the questionnaire. The participants were promised of confidentiality and a choice to withdraw anytime during the research. The two interventions took place after the class hours (4.30-8PM) in the evening starting with the child development

exhibition in the college courtyard and a panel discussion in the lecture theatre where other students other than the research participants were also invited. The research participants had been provided the post intervention questionnaire in the class before the interventions and were asked to hand over the filled questionnaire to one of the researchers through the class and the club-coordinator. So the researchers had no direct control over them. Anyone who was not interested could have easily refrained from submitting the questionnaire. The post intervention data was collected soon after the intervention. Interestingly, all 91 questionnaires were returned to the researchers, and therefore there was a 100% response from the participants. However, of the 91 respondents, twelve had left half the number of questions unanswered.

Each of the Action Research phases is explained in detail in the following sections.

# Reconnaissance

Mills (2007, p. 2) states that reconnaissance (also called preliminary information gathering), is "taking time to reflect on your own beliefs and to understand the nature and context of your general idea." In the reconnaissance phase, 91 final year students were involved in responding to a survey questionnaire, which largely asked the prevalence of responsible sexual behavior amongst students of the Paro College of Education. These groups of students were chosen intentionally by virtue of being their module tutors for the "Comprehensive Sexuality Education" (CSE) module, which at present is being piloted in the College. This module is taught for two hours every week. We intentionally also chose this group to see the impact of teaching this module.

Baseline data were gathered towards the end of the spring semester (2014) after the completion of the sexuality education module, which we offered in that semester for the two sections of 35 students each, and 21 club members. The questionnaire consisted of three constructs– information on STIs, Sexual Relationships and Sexual Activity. All items were worded in the affirmative with a five point Likert-type rating scale ranging from 'strongly disagree' to 'strongly agree' (see Appendix 1). There was a 100% response rate to this questionnaire because the student teachers were provided a time frame of 50 minutes to answer and return the questionnaire during one of our CSE classes. Checks for errors and inconsistencies were carried out before data entry. Survey responses were recorded using the idea of thematic coding. The data were further analyzed using descriptive statistics.

# Findings of the Reconnaissance phase

# **Knowledge of STIs against Sexual Practice**

The analysis of the base line data confirmed our assumption of the prevalence of irresponsible sexual behavior among the youths of the college. Ten items (for items, see Appendix 1) were set to check the knowledge on the sexually transmitted infections and the analysis of these items revealed a very high percentage (95%) of student-teachers with an understanding of sexually transmitted infections. Majority of the participants (88%) claimed to have adequate knowledge on sexually transmitted infections. However, item10 (see appendix1) on the sexual practice provided a different view. In contrast to 88% of participants having claimed to have adequate knowledge on STIs, 32.6% of the participants still preferred to have sex rather than

avoiding it due to the unavailability of condom. This clearly denotes that despite the adequate knowledge the student-teachers have, there was still a good number of students who were not able to apply their knowledge to their real life. Many participants (53%) claimed that they had been involved in sexual activity at least once in their lifetime. Such findings confirm the existence of gap a between adequate knowledge on STIs and extra marital-affairs and their practice (Figure 2).



Figure 2: Sexual Relationship against Sexual Practice

Ten items (see Appendix 1) were aimed at finding the student-teachers' perception on sexual relationship and ten items were set to find out the perception on their actual sexual practice. Items were put in different constructs to find out if there is a match between what they say and do or vice versa. The analysis of the base line data revealed an imbalance between what they claim and their actual practice. For instance, item 7 (I think extra-marital affairs are one of the most prevalent reasons for divorce and domestic violence) under construct 2 (see appendix1) was set to find out the student-teachers' opinion on sexual relationships and the findings revealed that 62.2% of the participants agreed that extra-marital affair was the cause of domestic violence and divorces. Analysis of item 5 (For me sexual activity can occur only in a serious relationship) under construct 3 confirmed 62% of the participants claimed that sexual activity can occur only in a serious relationship. Yet a good percentage has been led to sexual activity due to one or the other reasons (money -9.3%, care and affection -27.9%, and promises of marriage -42.3 %). Attitude towards casual sex is also very relaxed with 58.5% claiming that they do not see anything wrong in a casual sexual relationship as long as both the partners agreed and 25.2% agreed that sexual relationship is fine as long as commitment is sought (Figure 3).



Factors leading to involvement in sexual activity

# Figure 3: Knowledge against practice

Literature confirms that the gap between knowledge and practice is not a new trend. Young people in general seem to have very basic knowledge about what STIs are. For example Moore and Smith (2014) posit:

College students have been found to be very knowledgeable of HIV but less knowledgeable of STIs and general sexual health. College students often *perceive* that they are knowledgeable regarding STIs. They are often able to name common STIs such as HIV, genital herpes, gonorrhea, chlamydia, and genitalwarts...However, when evaluated, they are not able to describe the symptoms associated with STIs and do not know that STIs can be present without symptoms, demonstrating they may actually have less knowledge than they believe. (p. 436)

Findings from the baseline data confirmed that there is still gap between the youths' actual knowledge and their claims as identified above by Moore and Smith (2012). Hence intervention strategies had to be designed keeping the above points in mind. Therefore, the strategies framed were focused more on behavioral change rather than mere imparting of knowledge.

# Interventions: learning about the consequences of irresponsible sexual behavior.

We designed and implemented two interventions based on the existing literature on youth sexual behavior (see Pedlow & Carey, 2004; DeLamater, Wagstaff, & Havens, 2000; King, 1999). Both the interventions were employed one after the other, towards the beginning of November, 2014. In the exhibition on Child Development, exhibits were displayed which elaborated issues and topics on the development of the child, mother child issues, sexual health issues and issues relating to parenting. The first year students did it as part of their Child Development module. The 91 research participants were given a time frame of 60 minutes and were asked to go around and take part in the exhibition by observing, asking questions and watching videos on child development issues and issues relating to the effects of abortion and irresponsible sex. Post intervention data were collected right after the exhibition. The exhibition was followed by a two-hour panel discussion on the theme – *Sex, extra marital-affairs and abortion: its* 

*legal, health and spiritual consequences.* The panelists consisted of a medical officer, a legal officer from the Royal Bhutan Police and a senior Dzongkha lecturer from the College. As researchers both of us moderated the intervention sessions. Again post intervention data were collected as soon as the panel discussion was over.

Contrary to the other typical AR practices that exist in the University, we did not use the same baseline tool to collect the post intervention data. Instead a different questionnaire specifically designed to collect post intervention data (see Appendix 2) was used. This change in the tool was done referring to other international action research methods where we found that researchers had used different tools to collect the baseline and post intervention data (see Barret, 2011; Smith & Carney, 2011). The post intervention questionnaire consisted of two quantitative items, both worded in the affirmative with a five point Likert-type rating scale ranging from 'very poor' to 'excellent' and the rest of the questions were qualitative in nature (1. How would you have rated yourself as a responsible sexual partner before the panel discussion? And 2. Now that you have attended the panel session "Sex, extra-marital affairs and abortion- its legal, health and spiritual consequences." Circle how would you rate yourself as a responsible sexual partner on a scale of 1-5). Post intervention data were collected from all 91 participants. To maintain anonymity, survey participants are referred to as participant 1, 2, 3, 4,.....91. The quantitative data were then analyzed using SPSS and the qualitative data through content analysis.

# **Evaluation of the intervention**

Two items (see Appendix 2) were set in the post intervention data questionnaire to see if there were any differences in the student-teachers' rating as a responsible sexual partners. This was because the base line data analysis confirmed that though the student-teachers had very good knowledge on STIs and sexual relationships, their practice as a responsible sexual partners was poor (Figure 2). The post data analysis showed an improvement in the rating as shown in figure 4.



Figure 4: Post Intervention-Difference in rating as a responsible sexual partner before and after

The difference in the rating clearly indicated that the panel discussion made an impact on the participants. Initially only 15.3% of the participants rated excellent under considering themselves as responsible sexual partners but there was a drastic change in their rating after the panel discussion. After the panel discussion, 52% of the participants rated 'excellent', which indicated the effectiveness of the strategy. Further a female participant (52) commented that:

Though it was late for us but I believe it is not too late to be responsible sexual partners. I am now aware about the consequences of being unfaithful, (indulging in) unprotected sex and abortion. Knowing just the consequences is not enough but practicing the roles of [being] responsible sexual partner is important.

The comparison of base line data with the post intervention data suggested another startling finding: the claim that the participants made with regard to having adequate knowledge on STIs (95%) and use of condoms (75.3%) appeared doubtful. This is because 34 out of 91 participants declared that consequences of abortion and extra-marital affair were new knowledge for them. Similarly, 21 participants declared that using condom to prevent STIs was a new knowledge to them. This indicates that the knowledge that they claimed to have was either shallow or pretentious which points to the ineffective strategies used for delivering CSE content. Findings from this action research indicate that the panel discussion which comprised of question and answers related to health, legal and spiritual consequences of sex, abortion and marital affairs had far reaching consequences on the affective domains of learning. It is evident from the commitments made by the participants that the new knowledge acquired from the panel discussion helped them make future commitments. Spiritual consequences of sex, abortion and extra-marital affair was a new knowledge to the 21 participants; Health and legal consequences for 34 participants; and importance of acquiring Marriage Certificate (MC) before the birth of a child for 36 participants (See Figure 5).



Figure 5: New knowledge acquired from panel discussion

The new information had a huge impact on the participants as is evident from the commitments made by the participants (*refer figure 6 below*). When asked to give any five future commitments to ensure responsible sexual relationship, 51%, 48% and 68% of the participants made explicit commitment to use condom, be a responsible sexual partners, and avoid extra marital affairs respectively. Further, other commitments were made on applying the 3RS (being responsible, knowing one's right and being reasonable), advocacy, producing Marriage Certificate before

child birth, avoiding abortion, using family planning measures and following right time, right place and right partner. In general, everyone made one or the other five commitments.



Figure 6: Commitments made by student teachers towards responsible sexual relationship

The commitments that the participants have claimed are further reinforced by th the comments that they have made. For example, Participant 86 shared:

Before discussion I thought that having sex is not a big deal, it is like any other things we do in our day to day life but after the discussion my thinking is very much wrong, unsafe sex is like a crime, with it there are lots of problems that will make our life difficult and it is very much important to think thousand times before getting involved in sex.

# Further Participant 52 suggested that:

From my observation, many youths get involved in the sexual act after they qualify [complete] high school and get into college life. They build a sense of independence and feel that they are ready. It would be good if such informative and encouraging discussions were conducted from the beginning of the session. It would be more productive if made compulsory for all trainees to participate.

Pedlow and Carey (2004) observed that improvements in sexual communication skills and perceived norms for safer sex are associated with reductions in sexual risk outcomes. In general, almost everyone made very strong commitments to move towards responsible sexual relationships. Of the 91 respondents only twelve had left the questionnaire unanswered in the two items which asked if they learned any five new things or five future commitments they wanted to make. The rest answered all the items even though four out of nine questions were qualitative in nature. This is an indication that the intervention especially the panel discussion had brought about some change in their thought process.

# **Discussion and Conclusions**

In this action research, we set out to understand and examine the incidence of irresponsible sexual behavior in one of the higher learning institutes of the country. It was based on our assumptions, personal experiences and research findings that have time and again confirmed

the existence of youth sexual problems. This was indeed the case and, furthermore, because the study contained within its phases, interventions to strengthen the ability of making responsible decisions for college youth, we are able to extend the findings beyond the investigation to shed light on how improvement might be brought about in the arena of resolving irresponsible sexual behavior in our college youth.

This discussion is structured to answer the four research questions formulated to evaluate the impact of the intervention.

## Q1. What aspects of youth sexual issue did this action research address?

This action research confirmed the findings of the general literature that talks about the high prevalence of irresponsible sexual behavior amongst Bhutanese youth (Ministry of Health, 2014). The data collected from the baseline study confirmed that more than half the sample population (53%) had been involved in a sexual activity at least once in their lifetime. While a majority of the participants (88%) claimed to have adequate knowledge on STIs, a good number of college youth (32.6%) still preferred to have sex rather than avoiding it due to the unavailability of condom. In another sample of 17 members of the *Teachers' initiative for the empowerment of women and children club*, 15 out of 17 respondents cited irresponsible sexual relationship issues like dating, casual sex, problems associated with extra-marital affairs, and issues arising out of "ditching" one another. The baseline data also indicated that college youths have been led to irresponsible sexual activities due to various reasons like money, need for care and affection, promises of marriage, and having a casual outlook on sex and sexual activities.

Further, the research also employed strategies that could minimize irresponsible sexual behavior. As is evident from the analysis of the post-intervention, data revealed a huge shift in student's understanding about their own behavior and hence they made strong commitments that they promised to carry out in future. This is a huge achievement, knowing the fact that though youth irresponsible sexual behavior is discussed in Bhutanese literature and discussed at the policy level, very few interventions have taken place. This action research will thus help practitioners to design their own interventions that are context and culture specific.

# Q2. How did the intervention assist in understanding irresponsible sexual behavior in the college?

Coleman (cited in the WHO report, 2006) recognizes adolescence "as a time for learning to love oneself and others and to be responsible in one's relationships" (p. 8). He further states that:

During this period, young people develop intimate bonds and learn to enjoy the pleasures of sexual activity. They also learn about the health risks associated with sexual practices and behaviors, and their vulnerability to these risks – often at first hand. This period sets the stage for mature adult sexual relationships. (p. 8)

We contend that the interventions gave participants a platform to openly discuss and understand their personal issues in an informal and relaxed setting. These were issues that had often in the past, been set aside or neglected. The findings from the post intervention suggest that the strategies for delivering the content has to be always interactive and connected to real life like the panel discussion where there were lots of opportunities for the students to get involved in the discussions with real life practitioners. It also suggested that whatever was discussed in the classroom has to be related to real life situations. We also found that while having such discussions, if the panelists were real life practitioners, students believed them and were convinced of their knowledge, and therefore was more impactful then just the tutors sharing their theoretical knowledge.

Having real life panel members in the forum gave students a real life outlook to understanding the complexities of their personal issues. They realized the complexities involved in casual sexual relationships as in the words of participant 86 (see evaluation of intervention section above).

Pedlow and Carey (2004) observed that improvements in sexual communication skills and perceived norms for safer sex are associated with reductions in sexual risk outcomes. As is evident from the data, the interventions seem to have made a good impact on the students. Post intervention data revealed that of the 91 participants, *commitment* to use condom was made by 51% of them; 48% claimed that they would like to be responsible sexual partner and 68% wanted to avoid extra marital affairs. Further, other commitments were made on applying the 3RS (being responsible, knowing one's right and being reasonable), advocate, produce Marriage Certificate before child birth, avoid abortion, use family planning measures and follow right time, right place and right partner. In general, everyone made one or the other five commitments.

# Q3. What further interventions are required to address irresponsible sexual behavior in the college?

Pedlow and Carey (2004) confirm that interventions related to sexual risk reduction in young people have been implemented in a variety of settings. Their reviews and meta-analyses of the literature suggest that though interventions can be efficacious, few of the extant interventions have been replicated. Moreover, some interventions appear ineffective, and much of the variance in reducing sexual risk remains unaccounted for, suggesting that additional factors or theoretical frameworks are needed to guide future intervention studies. Thus, they conclude, "there remains an urgent need to continue to refine prevention programs" (p. 2).

Hence we propose that the college designs innovative programmess to teach sex education. In our review of different literatures we found that in the international context, several universities had taken innovative measures like using multi-media like the television and radio programs to approach sex education. Zwibelman and Rayfield (1982) cited in Cross and Morgan (2003, p.26) found that the college radio can be used to inform listeners about topics such as relationship issues, AIDS, women's issues, crises, condom use, and other relevant student issues such as self-esteem, gender roles, and anger. Other studies (White & Rubenstein (1984 as cited in Cross and Morgan, 2003, p. 26) found that such programmes can have positive effects in multiple areas, including increasing condom use and increasing awareness of how to respond to critical incidents. Some universities have come up with health and wellness websites on emergency contraception (like "not-2-late.com") which allows students to access accurate, up-to-date information under the anonymity of the World Wide Web. Traditional teaching strategies like "sex is bad" or moral "do's and don'ts" talk by teachers do not seem to be effective as is quite evident from our research as well as the vast amount of literature. Hence, taking several factors into consideration like culture, gender, age, place, and time,

university educators can be innovative in exploring and finding out different ways and means to connect to the students at the university.

### Q4. What problems could a next action research cycle address?

This study has given us deep insights into the issues that are important for the college students and lecturers. It has also made us reflect on our present practices. Most often because we are so focused on being just the 'teacher' in the sense of imparting knowledge, we often forget that students have more serious issues that they are not able to share with anyone. Most often we also tend to think that our 'job' finishes as soon as we leave the four walls of our classrooms. Action research as a method of inquiry has allowed us to develop the act of learning through observation, listening, analysing, questioning and being involved in constructing one's own knowledge.

Schofield (2014) posits, "Individuals and their behavior are profoundly influenced by the social environments in which people find themselves" (p. 25). Thus she says that one of the most effective ways to minimize such problems is by changing those conditions. Our research was an attempt to change the hidden yet disturbing condition prevailing in our college. Through this research, it is hoped that we have created awareness that there is a prevalence of irresponsible sexual behavior and that they have a direct impact on our students- and most importantly on those who are going to be future teachers. Through this research it is also hoped that we have an created awareness that different strategies could be explored to make both sexuality education module as well as the lives of hundreds of students more meaningful.

However, this research stops short of measuring the extent to which learning is internalised or implemented beyond the point of formal evaluation of an intervention. One cycle of action research is insufficient in terms of drawing conclusions about the seriousness of our students to sustain and apply learning in their own setting in a way that is actually responsible and healthy for themselves as well as for their partners. What needs to be researched at a deeper level is how can the university design and apply different interventions that are respectful and inclusive of the issues disturbing the university students. In addition, this research was a case of only one of the ten colleges of the Royal University of Bhutan; hence, there is also a need for a study bigger in scope, and involving a wider population of the university.

# Conclusion

This action research set out to understand the prevalence of irresponsible sexual behavior amongst the youth of the PCE. Baseline data collected indicated that there was a prevalence of irresponsible sexual behavior. Involvement in risky sexual activities, involvement in extramarital affairs, low condom use, inadequate knowledge on STI's and AIDS came out very prominently in the baseline data. This action research found that the interventions proved to be very effective. Hence, it is proposed that in future, similar interventions might be employed to curb the existing sexual behavior problems specifically in the college. However, one should be mindful of the culture and context of the problem and hence be careful to use developmentally and culturally appropriate interventions.

Our reflective journey on dealing with sexuality issues in the college arose out of the recurring problems that silently plagued our young people. As is often the case, generally with all Bhutanese teachers and lecturers, in the past, we would use negative, ad-hoc and spontaneous

Journal of Educational Action Research

responses, and quick-fix measures in our effort to control irresponsible sexual behavior. We realized that most often, such 'meetings' ended bitterly, and were very ineffective. Action research as a thorough and reflective process has helped us to define and refine our problem statement, set clear objectives, design and implement interventions and study the effects of the interventions. The process has helped us to understand the deep underlying issues that paralyze and hypnotize young people. We also realize the enlightening effect of a reflective journey as individuals. However, as Schofield (2014) posits, what is also equally important on the other hand, is building a positive "social environment" and a healthy approach to sexuality. As observed by Berne and Huberman (1999), we could "expend less time and effort trying to *prevent* young people from having sex and more time and effort in *educating them* to behave responsibly when they decide to have sex" (p. ix). Hence the focus of the leaders of the University and the policy makers at large should be on intentional and committed creation of an enabling environment that promotes healthy, happy and motivated individuals, who are proud of their relationships, respectful of theirs and others' sexuality, and mindful of their actions.

#### Acknowledgement

We would like to thank Dr. Kezang Sherab for initiating the Collaborative Action Research Project (CAR) in the College. Being the first of its kind, his leadership, guidance, mentorship and patience were invaluable. Our heartfelt thanks also goes to the research participants for their valuable contribution to this research. We would also like to thank the college management for promoting and supporting research endeavour. Our gratitude also goes to the external reviewers for their insightful feedback and comments on the report. Finally, we would like to convey our profound thanks to our family members for their unwavering support.

# Reference

- Abdullahi, M. & Umar, A. (2013a). Consequences of pre-marital sex among the youth, a study of university of Maiduguri. *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS)* 10 (1), 10-17 e-ISSN: 2279-0837, p-ISSN: 2279-0845. www.Iosrjournals.Org
- Abdullahi, M. & Umar, A. (2013b). Factors associated with engaging in pre-marital sex among the students of the university of Maiduguri. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Invention ISSN (Online): 2319 – 7722, ISSN (Print): 2319 – 7714 www. ijhssi.org, 2(10), 40-49.*
- Barret, T. (2011). Breakthrough in action research through poetry. *Educational Action Research*, 19, 5-21. Taylor & Francis Group.
- Bell, J. (2005). Doing your research project. New York, USA: Open University Press.
- Berne, L. & Huberman. (1999). European approaches to adolescent sexual behavior and responsibility. Retrieved from http://www.advocatesforyouth.org/storage/advfy/ documents/european.pdf
- Cardno, C. & Reynolds, B. (2008). Resolving leadership dilemmas in New Zealand kindergartens: An action research study. *Journal of Educational Administration*. Vol. 47 (2), 206-226. Emerald Group publishing Limited.
- Cross, E & Morgan, R. (2003). Sexual attitudes and behaviors of college students. *Journal* of *Student Affairs*. Vol. XII, page no...

- DeLamater, J., Wagstaff, DA., Havens, KK., (2000). The impact of a culturally appropriate STD/AIDS education intervention on Black male adolescents' sexual and condom use behavior. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/10929753
- Dorji, L. (2015). Sexual and reproductive health of adolescents and youths in Bhutan. Thimphu: National Statistics Bureau.
- Gibbons, A. (2013). The coaching and mentoring network: Mentoring definitions. Retrieved from http://www.coachingnetwork.org.uk/information-portal/Articles/ViewArticle. asp?artId=54
- Hine, G. S. C. (2013). The importance of action research in teacher education programs. In Special issue: Teaching and learning in higher education: Western Australia's TL Forum. *Issues in Educational Research*, 23(2), 151-163. http://www.iier.org.au/iier23/hine.html
- King, R. (1999). *Sexual behavioral change for HIV: Where have theories taken us.* Retrieved from http://www.who.int/hiv/strategic/surveillance/en/unaids\_99\_27.pdf
- Mills, G.E. (2007). *Action research: A guide for teacher researcher*. (3Ed.). Upper saddle river, NJ: Merrill.
- Ministry of Health, The national STIs and HIV/AIDS prevention and control programme (NACP) of the Department of Health (2014). *Bhutan Progress Report, Global AIDS response progress report.* Retrieved from http://www.unaids.org/sites/default/files/ country/documents//BTN narrative report 2014.pdf
- Ministry of Education, Department of Youth and Sports. (2010). *National youth policy*. Retrieved from http://www.gnhc.gov.bt/wp-content/uploads/2011/05/youth-policy.pdf
- Moore, E.W. & Smith, E.S. (2014). What college students do not know: What are the gaps in sexual health knowledge. *Journal of American College Health*, 60, (6). Retrieved from http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/07448481.2012.673521
- National Statistics Bureau. (2010). *Bhutan multiple indicator survey, study documentation*. Royal Government of Bhutan. Retrieved from https://www.google.bt/?gws\_rd=cr.ssl&ei=zinBVe3EAoGgyASdpqgAw#q=bhutan+multiple+indicator+survey+2010
- Norbu, K.,, Mukhia, S., & Tshokey. (2013). Assessment of knowledge in sexually transmitted infections and sexual risk behavior in two rural districts of Bhutan. *BMC Public Health*, pp. 2-6
- Omoteso, B. A. (2006). A study of the sexual behavior of university undergraduate students in south western Nigeria. *Journal of Social Science*, 12(2), 129-133.
- Pedlow, T. & Carey, M.P. (2004). Developmentally-appropriate sexual risk reduction interventions for adolescents: Rationale, review of interventions, and recommendations for research and practice. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/ PMC2452990/
- Schofield, J.W. (2013). Youth problems in Bhutan: Exploring their origins and routes to possible solutions. *Bhutan Journal of Research and Development*. iGNHaS. 2, (1), 27-39
- Smith, B.C. & Carney, C., (2011). Using art installations as action research to engage children and communities in evaluating and redesigning city center spaces. *Educational Action Research*, 19 (1) 23-39. Taylor & Francis Group.

- The World Bank. (2012). *HIV/AIDS in Bhutan*. Retrieved from http://www.worldbank.org/ en/news/feature/2012/07/10/hiv-aids-bhutan
- United Nations Development Programme. (2013). *Millennium development goals (MDG)* framework: youth employment in Bhutan. Retrieved from http://www.bt.undp.org/content/ dam/bhutan/docs/MDGs/MAF%20-%20Youth%20Employment%20in%20Bhutan%20 30%20Dec%202013.pdf
- World Health Organization (2006). *Defining sexual health: Report of a technical consultation on sexual health, 28-31st January 2002, Geneva.* Retrieved from http://www.who.int/ reproductivehealth/publications/sexual\_health/defining\_sexual\_health.pdf

# Appendix 1: Baseline Survey Questionnaire on student teachers' perception on irresponsible sexual relationship

# Royal University of Bhutan, Paro College of Education

# Responsible Sexual Relationship: Development, Challenges and Prospects. A survey of college youths.

Survey Questionnaire.

Dear Sir/Madam,

This study is undertaken to understand the prevalence of responsible sexual relationship amongst youth of Paro College of Education. The result of the study is intended to help youth to identify the characteristics of a responsible sexual relationship. It is also intended to inform parents and policy makers the development in the pattern of youth relationship and to understand the challenges faced by the college youth in maintaining responsible sexual relationship. In this regard, please give your genuine responses.

Please tick [  $\sqrt{}$  ] the most appropriate response

# **PART I: Demographic Information**

- 1. Sex a) Male b) Female
- Year of Study
   a). 1<sup>st</sup> Year b). 2<sup>nd</sup>. Year c). 3<sup>rd</sup>. Year d). 4<sup>th</sup> Year
- Marital Status

   a). Married
   b). Single c). In a relationship. d). Separated
   c). Divorce/ Divorcee
   f). Widower/Widow.
- 4). Do you have children?a). Yes b). No c). Expecting.

Please tick the boxes which correspond to your level of agreement or disagreement on the statements given below.

SI No	Statement	Strongly agree	Agree	Neither Disagree nor Agree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree
1.	I know what Sexually Transmitted Infections are	5	4	3	2	1
2.	I have adequate information regarding Sexual- ly Transmitted Infections.	5	4	3	2	1
3.	I use Condom in order to avoid STIs.	5	4	3	2	1
4.	I know that condom is the only way to protect against STIs.	5	4	3	2	1
5.	I think of the transfer of STIs before getting involved in sexual activity.	5	4	3	2	1
6.	I have suffered from one or the other form of STIs.	5	4	3	2	1
7.	I get worried about coming in contact with STI whenever I am in involved in sexual activity.	5	4	3	2	1
8	Fear of transmitting STIs to another is a concern for me	5	4	3	2	1
9.	I have adequate knowledge about handling STIs.	5	4	3	2	1
10.	I prefer having sex than avoiding it due to the unavailability of condom at that moment.	5	4	3	2	1

# 1. Perception on Sexually Transmitted Infections- (STIs).

# 2. Perception on Extra Marital Affairs.

1.	I have been involved in extra marital affairs at least once in my life.	5	4	3	2	1
2.	Involvement of money is an important factor that leads to extra-marital affairs.	5	4	3	2	1
3.	Need of affection and care lead to extra-marital affairs	5	4	3	2	1
4.	The thought of wrecking some one's family or my own family pulls me back from getting involved in extra-marital affairs	5	4	3	2	1
5.	Involvement in extra-marital affair is a casual thing for me.	5	4	3	2	1
6.	I know many cases of extra marital affairs.	5	4	3	2	1
7.	I think extra marital affairs are one of the most prevalent reasons for divorce and domestic violence.	5	4	3	2	1

# Journal of Educational Action Research

8.	Extra-marital affair has many bad consequences	5	4	3	2	1
9.	Abortion should be legal and permitted in Bhutan.	5	4	3	2	1
10.	Extra-marital affair is fine as long as commit- ment is not asked.	5	4	3	2	1

# 3. Perception on Sexual Activity

1.	I feel it is important to use condoms when I have sex	5	4	3	2	1
2.	I use condom in order to avoid pregnancy	5	4	3	2	1
3.	I prefer to use other forms of contraceptives to condom	5	4	3	2	1
4.	I feel it is necessary to be committed to your partner to get involved in sexual activity	5	3	3	2	1
5.	For me sexual activity can occur only in a serious relationship.	5	4	3	2	1
6.	Promises of getting married can convince me to get involved in sexual act.	5	4	3	2	1
7.	I know that weighing the consequences of sexual activity can avoid me from getting involved in it.	5	4	3	2	1
8.	Using condom/other contraceptives assures me of not becoming pregnant	5	4	3	2	1
9.	For me Sexual activity is casual.	5	4	3	2	1
10.	I am aware of the consequences of sexual activity.	5	4	3	2	1

Any Comments:

# Appendix 2: Consent Form for Participants

Action Research Project: Strategies for encouraging responsible sexual behavior amongst college youth: An action research case study at the Paro College of Education.

I,	have been clearly explained by
Mr/Mrs.	that this Action Research
has been carried out for academic purpose	Yes/No

I agree to participate in this activity, realising that I may withdraw at any time. Yes/No I agree that research data gathered for the study may be published using a pseudonym Yes/No I agree to the interview having my voice recorded and transcribed. Yes/No I agree to video recording my activities in the classroom/college. Yes/No

# Appendix 3: Post intervention data collection tool

Date: 16th October 2014

# "Encouraging Responsible Sexual Relationship amongst Youth of Paro College of Education"- An Action Research.

# Please circle the appropriate response.

1.	Gender
	a). Male b). Female
2.	Involvement in a sexual relationship
	a). Yes b). No c). Sometimes d). Once
3.	Which impacted you more
	a). Child development exhibition b). Panel discussion

4. On a scale of 1-5 (1-very poor, 2- poor, 3- average, 4- good, 5- excellent) **circle** how you would have rated yourself as a responsible sexual partner **before** the child development exhibition.

1 2 3 4 5

Now that you have attended the panel session on "sex, extramarital affairs and abortion-it's legal, health and spiritual consequences" circle how would you rate yourself as a responsible sexual partner, on a scale of 1- 5 (1- very poor, 2- poor, 3- average, 4- good, 5- excellent).

1 2 3 4 5

- 6. Observe the differences in the ratings between question 3 and 4 and explain the differences in about 150 words.
- 7. Write 5 new things you learned from the Panel discussion about responsible sexual behavior.
- 8. Write 5 commitments you want to make to yourself to build responsible sexual relationship.
- 9. Any pressing issues you want to share with us.

# Thank you for the time and support.

# Cultivating and improving classroom reinforcement strategies to optimise pre-service student teachers' learning

Ugyen Tshomo1 and Lhaden2

This action research looked at our reinforcement practices and consequently aimed at cultivating and improving classroom reinforcement strategies. According to the baseline data, we did not use many tangible and intangible reinforcements. For example, our teaching experiences in the College had informed us that students hardly participated in learning activities such as responding to our questions in the class. It was also observed that when students were on teaching practice they rarely used reinforcement while teaching. More alarmingly, anecdotes and informal discussions notified us that we ourselves scarcely used a variety of reinforcement during our teachings. As a result, for this research project, we applied intervention strategies such as meditation, the magic box, classroom code of conduct, jokes, songs, energizers, hot seat and placards in our teaching to address the concerns mentioned above. The data was collected from two sections of pre-service student teachers (a group of second year (N=34) and final year students (N=31) using a survey questionnaire. This action research was carried out over a semester (Autumn 2014) for one cycle. Post intervention data were collected through class observation, self-reflective diary, survey questionnaire and journals maintained by students to check the effectiveness of the intervention strategies. Findings from post-intervention data analysis indicated that we showed improvement in the use of reinforcement that in turn facilitated student participation.

Key words: teaching, reinforcement, motivation, tangible, intangible

### Situational Analysis

Our interest in the topic began when we (teacher 1 & teacher 2) were sharing our experiences from field visits such as teaching practice supervision and teaching observations in the schools with each other. Our main concern from these experiences was the existence of poor teacher-student relationships in the Bhutanese context. Teachers were also not approachable and students' showed difficulty in expressing their ideas even if they knew the correct answers. The same thing happened in our classrooms as well and reflecting upon our teaching practices as teacher educators, it was observed that few students participated during the question-answer sessions and group discussions. Punctuality was another problem among students. They failed to come to class on time and also they wanted to leave the class before time. Reflecting upon ourselves as students, we realized that we were also quiet in the class. Both of us agreed that we hardly interacted with our teachers in the class. We also tended not to participle much in question/answer and discussion sessions. Analysing those habits, we came to a conclusion that our own cultural background (coming from traditional and disciplined families), where

<sup>1.</sup> Senior Lecturer, Paro College of Education. E-mail: ugyentshomo.pce@rub.edu.bt

<sup>2.</sup> Associate Lecturer, Paro College of Education. E-mail: lhaden.pce@rub.edu.bt

quietness is equated to a disciplined child, where a child is to remain silent until spoken to played a significant role in our behaviour. We think that this 'culture of muteness' has influenced our nature as teachers as well. We carried this culture to the classroom and shared it with our students. Thus, it impacted their participation in the class as well. Also from the student feedback collected towards the end of the semester, many students were of the opinion that we were not approachable and usually scolded them. Reflecting on these experiences, we thought something must be lacking in our practices. Hence, what can be done to overcome the issues like poor teacher-student relationship, lack of teacher approachability, sense of humor, student punctuality and little student participation in the classroom?

Reinforcement and different schedules of reinforcement are found to have a positive impact on the acquisition of knowledge and behavior. Hoque (2013) further mentions how students become more enthusiastic and willing to volunteer answers and participate actively in any discussion resulting in new point of discussion with reinforcement.

Along the same lines, the Colleges of Education, Samtse and Paro (2007) consider effective use of teacher reinforcement as an important skill in teaching and learning. Student-teachers are trained to use a variety of reinforcement in the class to motivate learners to participate in class activities. However, during our six years of supervision of student- teachers, it has been observed that students use minimal reinforcement in the classrooms resulting in minimal responses from their students.

One of the ways of motivating the students to be active learners in the classroom could be through the immediate response and reaction of the teacher (Smith, n.d). The way the teacher responds to the student's action or behavior determines how the teacher sets the tone and makes the learning environment favorable (Conroy, Sutherland, Snyder, Al-Hendawi & Vo, 2009). This can be achieved through a variety of reinforcement strategies that the teacher uses with the students for performing a desired task or showing a desired behavior. Reinforcement is an essential component of good teaching and learning. If the students are constantly reinforced for the task that they are engaged in, they more enthusiastically approach the next task (Newcomer, 2009; Simonsen, Fairbanks, Briesch, Myers & Sugai, 2008). Thus, it is important that teachers provide continuous and appropriate reinforcement to have a better flow of the lesson. With our experiences and observations, reinforcements in the Bhutanese classes are largely limited to verbal and body language (sometimes vague and confusing). This action research study helped us try out how other forms of reinforcement might benefit the learners and influence our change in practice. Considering the different learners with different learning needs and styles, a wide variety of reinforcers were used.

The present study intended to try out a variety of reinforcement strategies to focus on the issue of class participation and evaluate how such practices helped students improve their learning and academic achievements. Through positive feedback and scheduled reinforcement, learners will be encouraged to actively participate in the future. McLeod mentions B.F Skinner's operant conditioning theory as how a behavior that is reinforced tends to continue while the behavior that is punished will be extinguished (2007).

Throughout the action cycle, both the researchers and students evaluated the quality of the reinforcement considering the four steps provided by Conroy et al. (2009):

U. Tshomo and Lhaden

- Frequency- how often?
- Type general or specific?
- Equity do all students receive praise?
- Appropriateness for developmental levels.

### Literature review

The review of literature is focused on the importance of reinforcement, definitions and types of reinforcement as well as what makes an effective reinforcement. The idea of reinforcement in learning gained popularity when B.F Skinner put forward his operant conditioning theory (McLeod, 2007). Reinforcement is the main element in his idea of stimulus-response association, which then became a broadly applied principle in teaching and learning. As per Alfred (2008), reinforcement is the most important strategy most teachers use in the classrooms as a classroom management tool. It can stimulate student participation and academic achievement and transform students' character. Sherab's (2013) action research on the Bhutanese teacher education classroom also suggests that reinforcement can also motivate students to open up and share their experiences and opinions if they are provided with opportunities.

Reinforcement is a stimulus that strengthens the frequency of behavior that precedes it and is contingent upon a behavior, which increases the probability that a specific behavior will occur (Smith, nd; Peters, 2010; Heffner, 2014). All three authors have interesting views on reinforcement because there is a pleasant condition involved which creates a positive relationship between the stimulus and the response. Their views make good sense in an educational setting as a lot of positive energy is generated during the occurrence of behavior, which will directly create a sound learning environment that will promote learning in the students. Skinner (1938, 1953) in his operant conditioning theory considered reinforcement as a key element in changing behavior for a desired response. He describes two types of reinforcements, positive and negative. According to Skinner (2014) and McLeod (2007) both positive and negative reinforcements strengthen behavior by providing a consequence that an individual finds rewarding in case of positive reinforcement and stopping the unpleasant experience in the negative reinforcement. Though this is true in most situations, sometimes negative reinforcements may discourage the learners and instead of strengthening the behavior it will lead to inappropriate behavior. On the other hand, Smith (n.d.) claims negative reinforcement to be very effective in creating a class environment safe for learners which is more often naturally occurring and can be even more effective if paired with social reinforcement like a smile, a word of encouragement, a nod, or a sign of approval.

The use of reinforcement strategies in the classroom can be a motivating factor for managing student behavior and maximizing the learning outcome. In addition to other strategies in classroom management, having a good strategy of reinforcement to motivate the students can attract the attention and boost the interest of the students in the class (Newcomer, 2009; Simonsen, Fairbanks, Briesch, Myers, & Sugai, 2008). In order to motivate the learners, reinforcement should be scheduled and a criteria needs to be set. (Peters, 2010; Reeve, 2009; Smith, n.d.). As stated by Tuckman and Monetti (2010) learners themselves come to class with different experiences of reinforcements and personal histories that it is always difficult to create one list of reinforcement that would motivate all students. This view is also supported by the use of a variety of reinforcement in prompting the responses of the students while asking

Journal of Educational Action Research

questions and handling responses appropriately (College of Education, Samtse & Paro, 2007). Thus, using a variety of reinforcements made sense here. Maslow (1943) in his Theory of Human Motivation intensely discusses around these factors of motivation-"primary needs, safety needs, the love needs, the esteem needs and through his paper he claims that "man is a perpetual wanting animal" (p. 18) mostly waiting for recognition and eventually, "satisfaction of the self-esteem need leads to feelings of self-confidence, worth, strength, capability and adequacy of being useful and necessary in the world" (p. 10). Thus, teachers need to recognize this fact and make their learners feel needed and essential in order for them to become proactive learners. These motivational needs serve as a condition for being accepted, respected and valued by others for a performed behavior, which a teacher is capable of implementing in the classroom through a variety of reinforcers such as tangible, activity, social and token reinforcers. Tangible reinforcers include concrete reinforcers such as stickers, certificates, tokens, and treats. Intangible reinforcers are usually abstract motivators such as verbal comments, smiles and laughs, compliments, games, songs and dances including special privileges. These different types of reinforcers are necessary for diverse learners. "Every class is different, and several types of reinforcers may be used to motivate different students" (Peters, 2010).

Teacher attributes such as specific use of praise as a form of verbal reinforcement or a written statement, while recognizing a desired or correct behavior will increase social and academic behavior (Curran & the IRIS Center, 2003). Teachers must remember to use praise effectively and specifically and let the students know that the attentions provided through praises are pleasurable and motivational (Curran & the IRIS Center, 2003). This idea can sometimes mislead the Bhutanese students' thoughts because the general understanding of praise in the Bhutanese society is usually not pleasurable and motivational. Praise is also not a very common practice in Bhutan and because of this being rooted in the culture, our practices have been influenced which has led to sparing praise in the classroom as well. Thus, teachers must use praise effectively when a specific desired behavior is recognized. Evertson, Emmer, and Worsham, (2003 as cited in Curran & the IRIS Center, 2003, p. 8) suggest to "ensure that each student receives some form of sincere and accurate praise or recognition." Attention is to be drawn to this statement because we usually praise those high achievers only and the low achievers are usually ignored.

Using reinforcement strategies in the classroom keeps the students motivated throughout the year. Programmed instructions can be used to make reinforcements effective (Skinner, 1968) and one such way is signing Class contracts or classroom code of conducts which are excellent ways to introduce reinforcement in the class (Peters, 2010). In addition, a carefully planned token economy usually paired with specific praise will be a useful reinforcer (Peters, 2010). "Verbal behavior is frequently overemphasized because it is easily imported into the classroom, and a shift to nonverbal knowledge, where natural contingencies are more effective, has been worthwhile" (Skinner, 1968, p. 155). This is again true in the Bhutanese situation because most of the time our classroom reinforcement is limited to verbal reinforcement and with changing times it is necessary to use a variety of reinforcements. In addition to using a variety of reinforcements, it is also important to design better contingencies to improve teaching and learning (Skinner, 1968). Other forms of reinforcement like meditation (Chai, 2012; Lazer, 2015) improves the human brain and enhances learning capacity. Fischer (2001) also acknowledges how jokes, dances and songs help boost positive learning in the class.

# U. Tshomo and Lhaden

The evidence (Curran, 2003; Peters, 2010; Skinner, 2014; Smith, n.d.) from the literature shows that reinforcement when used appropriately promotes student motivation, enhances student interests and improves classroom ambience. As of date, there has been no research done in the Bhutanese context on how reinforcement can impact students' learning. This action research study shows how reinforcement can truly impact students' learning in the class. It also demonstrates strategies to be used in providing a variety of reinforcements.

Teachers need to use a variety of reinforcement strategies and in addition design better contingencies and schedules of reinforcement using available knowledge. The research accumulated over time discusses the relation between reinforcement and student behavior and classroom management skills. However, reinforcement can be used beyond classroom management and dealing with inappropriate behavior like managing cell phone issues while teaching. A final thought is to study the relation between reinforcement strategies and improvement of student performance in academics or content knowledge.

# **Research Question:**

This study focused on the following questions.

- How can we improve our reinforcement strategy in the class?
- How can we motivate our students to participate actively in the class?
- How can we use stimulating pedagogy to motivate our students in the class?
- How can we improve our manner and style in the class to inspire the students to learn?

# Methods

The study was carried out with a total of 65 participants consisting of 31 final year students and 34 second year students. The action research study used mixed method approach and we identified five different data sources. We used survey questionnaires, open-ended questions, reflective journals maintained by the students including student narrative opinions and feedback, research diary (notes and digital) of the teachers and classroom observation, and feedback from critical friends. Data were generated before the action cycle, during the action cycle and after the action cycle and was analyzed through comparing the two sets of data.

The baseline data were gathered during the first week of August 2014. The purpose and intent of the study was explained well to the participants and a mutual understanding was developed between the researcher and participants by signing the consent form to avoid ethical issues. The survey questionnaire consisted of items based on five different themes identified with the help of literature (see Appendix 1 for items).

- Importance of positive reinforcement in classroom teaching and learning (only in baseline to design intervention strategies)
- Teacher's attributes
- Tangible reinforcement
- Intangible reinforcement
- Negative reinforcement

Participants were asked to rate the items on a 3-point Likert –type scale ranging from "often", "sometimes" to "never" of our actions. The last question determining the importance of positive reinforcement was based on a five point Likert scale ranging from "least important" to "very important" which was adopted from Mackenzie (2008). There were also two openended questions in which participants had to discuss in detail about the impacts of positive and negative reinforcements to their behavior and learning. We collected the baseline data from 65 students (31 final year & 34 second year students). Accordingly we designed the intervention strategies, which are discussed later in the section– intervention strategies. We began the action cycle from 11<sup>th</sup> August till 10<sup>th</sup> October 2014 for a period of 9 weeks. This cycle was guided by a type of reinforcement menu, which was fixed on the wall of the respective classrooms to remind both the teachers and the students (see Figure 1).



Figure 1: Reinforcement Menu

# **Post Intervention Data**

The following intervention strategies were designed to address the issue of lack of reinforcement in our teaching that emerged from our own concerns and which was later confirmed through the analysis of the baseline data. The intervention strategies were designed with the help of literature (see literature review section). The implementation of intervention strategies began from 11<sup>th</sup> August to 10<sup>th</sup> October. Following are the intervention strategies implemented in this action research.

U. Tshomo and Lhaden

# Meditation

Meditation was conducted at the beginning of each class for 5-10 minutes. It was usually guided meditation using the sound of waves, birds, flute, and YouTube where the speaker guides you into an imaginary world. Most of the learners gave positive feedback on this activity. This short meditation was purposely introduced to imitate schools that religiously practiced meditation as a matter of a prescribed activity. Till then no one conducted an impact study and we piloted a similar activity to study its impact. This meditation was practiced as a belief (PAR field visit experience 2013) to improve the learner's attention span. From this study it exhibited that if meditation is conducted appropriately it has a positive impact on learners. To cite a participant, "Meditation gives the mind a break, offering an opportunity to detach from the chaos of our lives and seek shelter in silence and stillness. After meditating I feel relaxed and forget all the tension. It also creates a friendly environment with my friends" (Participant 8). Another participant said, "I felt relieved at least for some moment and I enjoyed the peaceful atmosphere in the thoughts" (Participant 26). Dalai Lama in his interview with Barbara Chai mentions that meditation gives calmness to our mind, controls brain activities; it gives time to investigate our nature thus creating awareness of our surrounding (Chai, 2012). Even Lazar (2015) in her interview with Schulte (2015) mentioned that meditation can change your brain and reduces stress. We thought that in order to do individual and unguided meditation the teacher needs proper training on "mindfulness" which will prepare them to have a deeper knowledge and skills related to meditation.

# The Magic Box

The word "magic" is derived from the magical effects of its etymology and how children are usually excited by the word "magic." The Magic Box was another intervention strategy used to improve reinforcement. It is actually a box containing list of goodies such as an apple, a pencil, soap, toothpaste, book, tissue paper, tea with teacher, lunch with teacher, and sanitary napkins. A student who could participate five times in a row within the session gets to pick a chip containing a gift from the box. A participant reiterated the rationale of the magic box "the best thing about magic box was if the person participates five times then that person gets to pick up from the box. This maximized the participation in class and everyone was gearing towards picking it up" (Participant 6). "Magic box always created an exciting environment in the class" (Participant 26). "Magic box reinforcement is one of a kind of reinforcement I ever experience in learning process. This kind of reinforcement really bring changes in learners; they are always active and participate in the class, so they can get chance to pick from the magic box felt more pleasure and motivated when I hit the magic box (Participant 19). According to our observation, shy students were a little reluctant in the beginning. But eventually it motivated them to participate. This action research study corroborates the findings of an earlier study on Bhutanese pre-service teachers' classroom engagement that some shy students gradually participate if teacher educators create conducive environments for students to participate in and contribute to the learning process (Sherab, 2013). With regard to the role of token in student motivation Ihiegbulem, Ihiegbulem and Igwebuike (2011) concluded that the extent of academic achievement of the experimental (motivated with token) group of Integrated Science students was moderate, while that of the control group that were not motivated with token was on the average low. Thus this token motivator also had positive impacts on the learners.

# **Classroom Code of Conduct**

Teachers and learners collaboratively drew the "Classroom Code of Conduct", which is a set of classroom rules both teacher and students agreed upon. This was drawn to make an agreement upon a set of classroom norms so that the flow of classroom discussion, activity and teaching were not disturbed. It was also to avoid inappropriate behavior like use of cellphone in the class while teacher was teaching or during serious class discussions. Interestingly there was a clause, which says "class starts 10 minutes after the previous session". A few students claimed it as their right and started coming 10 minutes late for the class. But otherwise this was a good strategy to set the class decorum since this strategy dictated the behaviors that were appropriate for their classroom. If students design classroom rules it has more benefits in terms of promoting sense of ownership, community responsibility and exhibiting a democratic process (Malone & Tietjens, 2000; Weinstein, 2003 as cited by Curran, 2003). As Skinner (2014, p. 129) aptly put it, "behavior must be appropriate to the occasion."

# Placard

Comments written on placards were deliberately used so that visual learners remember the written reinforcement like "fabulous" and "magnificent". Each time a student gives a correct answer; the teacher picks a placard and shows it to the class while the rest of the students read it. Discussing about the placard intervention, one of the participants mentioned that, "designing a tag with reinforcement like "superb" and "excellent" encouraged participants more and reminded other[s] to take opportunity to be in that encouraged position" (Participant 23). Another student comments, "this kind of reinforcement act as a gesture that keeps the student[s] motivated" (Participant 25) and eventually it seems to "make students feel nice" (Participant 28). Such intervention was introduced for visual learners who not only hear words but also can read and remember them. Eventually it became habituated for us to use the placards to break the monotony of providing common reinforcements such as 'good, nice and beautiful'.

# Verbal and non-verbal reinforcements

Spontaneous verbal reinforcements such as 'cool, correct, beautiful, keep it up' were used as yet another intervention in this study. Besides that, whenever students participated, we delivered immediate non-verbal reinforcements like 'a tap on the shoulder, walk close to the student, nod, smile, and give a thumbs up, or a high five' in close proximity to the student.

# Jokes

Jokes were another intervention used by us. Jokes can break the rigidity of the classroom and students respond positively to a teacher who can joke with them or break out in songs and dances (Fischer, 2001). We explored online sites and shared jokes with the students before and in between the lesson. At times we made students share jokes in the class. Even Sherab (2013) in his findings stated that if teachers lack humor they appeared inaccessible to students and eventually students were discouraged to participate actively in the class. Not much time and effort was spent on this intervention by both of us because both of us were not comfortable with humor. Thus in the feedback with regard to the "jokes" item both of us scored low.

U. Tshomo and Lhaden

### Songs

We sometimes began the class with songs. Karaoke songs were downloaded and played in the class. Students were made to read the lyrics and sing out loud along with the singer. According to Budden (2011) music not only can play a significant role in language learning but can set the scene and change the tempo of the class. According to participant 15 "music helps balance the energy level of all the students." Thus music can wake up sleepy students or calm energetic ones. One of the participants (26) shared, "every one of us enjoy singing and listening to songs. We become very energetic and it keeps us active throughout the lesson." Songs are also said to be therapeutic in nature from serving newborns to treating hospital patients, music can be used for medical and psychological treatment (Howland, 2015). One student agrees to the statement when s/he mentioned, "songs made me relaxed…it was a very effective method to have the holiday hang-over minds back to academics" (Participant 29).

### Energizer

We sometimes used energizers like rhymes, brainteasers, and riddles in between the lessons. These energizers kept the learners active (see http://www.laughterforachange.org/videos/games-we-play/ for energizers).

# Hot Seat

The term hot seat can refer to: "Being in the hot seat", an expression used for a high-pressure situation in which a great deal of attention and scrutiny is focused on a person or organization (Wikipedia, 2014). It is also a slang for an electric chair; a former syndicated politically oriented talk show in the United States. It is also used in a former ABC game show in the United States now called "KBC" (Kon Baneyga Corpati) in India. KBC also uses the word "hot seat" for the player (Wikipedia, 2014). Hot seat was used as negative reinforcement for those learners who did not do their assignments/homework in time. It was also used for students who broke a classroom code of conduct. The student was asked to sit on the chair placed in the corner of the class for 10 minutes and complete the necessary task while rests of the students waited. This puts pressure on the student seated on the hot chair. This was the only negative reinforcement used by us to strengthen the learner's behavior (Skinner, 2014). It gives time for the student to realize their mistake. Firstly, while offered the seat a student knows s/he has not completed the task. Secondly, s/he completes the task, as rest of the class waits thereby simultaneously putting the student on a guilt trip. Only by behaving in an agreed manner s/he may become free of "guilt" (Skinner 2014, p. 190). Thirdly, having to complete the unfinished task within a specific time in front of whole class is really no fun. Thus this reinforcement was given to those who did not complete their task with a hope that it had an abiding effect (Skinner, 2014), but it had its lapses too. For instance, one of the participants (10) rightly mentioned that "sitting in a corner for 10 minutes and having 31 pairs of eves on ... is really embracing. More over others who have completed the task will be wasting 10 minutes."

### Comparison of baseline data with post intervention data

Data of both teacher 1(T1) and teacher 2(T2) has been punched and inserted in figures and tables For convenience and approximate we have put them in parallel so that the comparativeness can be read at a glance.
Journal of Educational Action Research



According to the baseline data, it appeared that positive reinforcement is very important. Reinforcers such as verbal (e.g. excellent, wonderful praise), nonverbal communication (e.g., smiles, nods, thumbs up, high five etc.) and "teacher as a motivating factor" (pedagogy, tone, language, dress etc.) appeared to help the learners. In the survey data 18 participants for teacher1 and 15 in teacher2 indicated "praise and nonverbal" as priority and 19 participants for teacher1 and 22 for teacher2 chose "Teacher as motivating factor" (see figure 1 and 2). "Social attention" also seems to be the third priority reinforcer for learners. According to Radcliffe (2000) kids love praise they like to hear when they're on track, doing the right thing.

Teacher's attributes (T1)	<u>baseline (n=31)</u>			post	intervention (	( <u>n=31)</u>
	often	sometimes	never	often	sometimes	never
Teacher is approachable	28	3	0	29	2	0
Teacher allows flexi time (5-10 min)	27	4	0	24	7	0
extends assignments	13	17	1	23	8	0
Variety Teaching pedagogy	24	7	0	27	4	0
Teacher's dress code as motivator	10	21	0	13	18	0
Teacher's language	24	7	0	25	6	0
Teacher's tone	22	9	0	23	8	0
Personal conversation	8	20	3	10	18	3

*Table 1:* Score for various teachers' attributes (T1)

As shown in Table 1, there is an increase for almost all the teacher attributes except for "teacher allows flexi time". For example, "teacher is approachable" increased from 28 to 29. A participant (28) commented, "I think one of her teaching strengths is her approachable personality." Although it is not a substantial increase, there are some indications of positive impact. To cite a participant (17), "I will try to be a role model as my tutor used to be. I will try to be the one where every needy people could approach me as my tutor is." Another attribute that has shown some improvement is the, "Teacher finds personal conversation" which increased from 8 to 10. This is an indication that learners like teachers who finds time to listen to them.

#### U. Tshomo and Lhaden

To quote a participant (1), "Madam also foster[s] positive relationships with us by conveying respect, being compassionate and by listening carefully to our problems." Likewise as per the baseline data only 24 participants chose "often" for attribute– "teacher uses variety of teaching pedagogy" but post intervention showed an increase to 27. This teacher attribute is another crucial factor that encourages learners. A participant (24) rightly shared, "the element of interaction and the variety our tutor brings in the class or during the lesson acts as a plus point in attracting and focusing our attention towards the lesson." The response for "Teacher extends assignment date" has increased from 13 to 23. A participant (23) shared "teachers are life changer for the students, they play vital role in the life of a student."

Teacher's attributes (T2)	Baseline(n=34)			post intervention(n=34)		
	often	some- times	never	often	some- times	never
Teacher is approachable	22	11	1	4	27	2
Teacher allows flexi time	3	26	5	19	12	2
Extends assignments	9	17	8	0	13	20
Variety of teaching pedagogy	8	23	3	6	27	0
Teacher's dress code as motivator	5	24	5	6	17	10
Teacher's language	1	11	22	4	25	4
Teacher's tone	4	24	5	4	21	8
Personal conversation	1	9	24	0	9	24

*Table 2:* Score for various teacher's attributes (T2)

Teacher 2 showed improvements in allowing flexi time to the students (3/34 in the baseline and 19/34 in the post intervention marked as "often").



Figure 4: Tangible reinforcement T1

Journal of Educational Action Research



Figure 5: Tangible reinforcement T2

Under tangible reinforcement if you read the above figure, teacher has never used stickers and certificates both in baseline and post intervention data. Interestingly though, the teacher1 used "magic box" as intervention under "tokens" and status of the item has decreased from 26 in baseline to 5. To cite a participant "I got [a] mug from the magic box a beautiful mug which had touchy quotes written on it. The mug really inspired me and since then I try to volunteer as much as possible" (P28). Another participant said, "The reinforcements of giving apples and chocolates to participants in the class really built the attitudes of learners towards learning process" (Participant 19). Teacher 2 improved the use of tangible reinforcement such as stickers (0/34 rated "often" in the baseline and it has gone up to 2/34 in the post intervention), tokens and treat (0/34 in the baseline and 12/34 and 4/34 in the post intervention (see figure 4).

#### U. Tshomo and Lhaden

Intangible Reinforcement(T1)	baseline			p	ost interventio	n
	often	sometimes	never	often	sometimes	never
verbal comments	30	1	0	28	2	0
smiles/laughs	29	2	0	28	3	0
Compliments	26	5	0	23	7	1
Nods	22	9	0	20	10	1
high fives	0	5	26	4	1	26
Games	0	16	15	5	24	1
free time	11	19	1	11	20	0
library time	1	26	4	11	20	0
assignment	6	24	1	15	16	0
Songs	23	8	0	22	9	0
Dances	2	9	20	6	21	4
Jokes	0	20	11	2	26	0

Table 3: Score for "Intangible Reinforcement data (T1)"

Under intangible reinforcements – verbal comments, smiles, laughs, compliments, nods have recorded higher in the baseline data but in the post intervention data there is no increase in the score. This could probably be because according to baseline data the teacher (Teacher 1) possessed those qualities already. If I quote from participant's report, "the tutor always took the response of the students positively and followed up the question that made us to correct our own errors. For example "good, now let's take it a step further", "keep going", "not quite, but what if we include" (Participant 8) "The broad smile on your face and motivational words awaked me out of the world of darkness....." (Participant 8).

Intangible reinforcement(T1)	Baseline			P	ost interventio	<u>on</u>
	Often	Sometimes	Never	Often	Sometimes	Never
Verbal comments	14	19	1	23	8	0
Smiles/Laughs	17	17	0	9	24	0
Compliments	19	14	1	10	19	2
Nods	0	3	30	19	14	0
High fives	0	5	29	0	5	28
Games	0	28	6	0	11	22
Free time	1	20	13	0	22	11
Library time	11	19	4	0	14	19
Assignment time	0	1	33	0	8	25
Songs	1	0	33	0	26	7
Dances	6	17	11	0	4	29
Jokes	0	3	31	1	29	2

Table 4: Score for "Intangible Reinforcement data (T1)"

Teacher 2 showed improvement in verbal comments (refer table 4) and another area where teacher 2 showed improvement is in the nonverbal comments like nods (0/34 rated "often in the baseline and 19/34 in the post intervention). Smiles/laughs also showed improvements (17/34 rated "sometimes" in the baseline and it has gone up to 24/34 in the post intervention). Use of songs as a reinforcement also improved (0/34 rated "sometimes" in the baseline and it has gone up to 29/34).



*Figure 6:* Negative reinforcement (T1)

#### U. Tshomo and Lhaden

According to data in Figure 6, teacher 1 has not used much of negative reinforcement. Except for "screaming" 27 participants marked as "sometimes". In baseline data when participants were asked "How did negative reinforcement affect you?" most of the participants for teacher 1 wrote negative reinforcements "discourages learning", "hurts them and they are embarrassed in the crowd", it creates negative environment and instills fear" and on contrary few of them responded by saying such reinforcement acts as "constant reminder not to make same mistake again" and it will also act as "self-realization of one's errors", and "help us change".



*Figure 7:* Negative reinforcement (T2)

Data in figure 7 presents that teacher 2 reduced the use of negative reinforcements. Teacher never used physical punishment (zero in both pre and post intervention). While there was decrease in the use of negative reinforcements in general, the teacher scolded the students (0/34 rated "often in the baseline and increased to 13/34).

#### **Findings and Discussion**

Findings from this action research indicate that if teachers employ reinforcement strategies appropriately in their teachings, it helps to enhance students' learning, classroom ambience and student-teacher relationship (Newcomer, 2009; Simonsen, Fairbanks, Briesch, Myers & Sugai, 2008). Our conclusion is based on how intervention strategies helped us in the smooth functioning of the class and positive learning. Findings also showed that the classroom Code of Conduct drawn between students and teachers helped in self-disciplining. Furthermore, the reinforcement strategies employed helped students in maintaining their dress code, managing cell phone issues, coming prepared for the class, reduced unwanted discussions and digression from lesson, keeping the classroom clean, eating goodies in the class, and instilling proper learning attitude. Therefore, in order to motivate the learners to learn, reinforcement should be scheduled and criteria needs to be set (Peters, 2010; Reeve, 2009; Smith, n.d.). Interventions like "meditation" and "songs" set the class tempo and mood. According to Budden (2011) music can play a significant role in language learning by setting the scene and changing the tempo of the class. We participated in singing and dancing activities in the class, which made us more approachable. As we progressed with various intervention strategies, we observed

that students started discussing about their personal issues and most of them became open in the class. Such findings are in similar line to earlier research, which concluded that students respond positively to a teacher who can joke with them or break out into songs and dances (Fischer, 2001). Findings from this action research showed that the use of variety of teaching pedagogies and reinforcements we used during our teachings encouraged student participation in various activities. Students became hardworking. As per the "reflective journal" from participants it showed that they read and prepared for the class so that they could receive tokens from the "magic box".

Findings from this research also indicate that negative reinforcement needs to be scheduled and needs to be more varied unlike what was done in this study where we used only one form of negative reinforcement. Eventually whole classroom control lies in the hands of teachershow teacher behaviour seems to affect his/her students and vice versa. Skinner (2014, p. 313) rightly pointed out that, "A behaves in a way which alters B's behavior because of the consequences which B's behavior has for A."

#### Recommendation

This journey of action research was very fruitful and adventurous for us. We recommend that teachers in the field use the intervention we employed in the research to enhance classroom participation of their students. More so this action research was first of its kind in the Bhutanese context. Along with the learning, we had many challenges in the process of carrying out the research.

The first problem we had was the scarcity of classroom resources. We as researchers needed resources like speakers, placards, magic boxes which were not easily available. Moreover we had to carry these resources all the time since there were no safe lockers in the classrooms. Thus, if the classroom is equipped with a closet and desktop computer it would ease the cumbersomeness of teachers having to carry such materials every time. We needed lots of online and library resources for the research but books were limited in the library and finding online journal was tedious because of the poor internet connectivity.

We came to know that the "observation form" for the teacher was limited. The form included space for taking notes of only the observer's comment and teacher's comment. It did not specify on how the teacher conducted the intervention strategy, timeframe and how the students participated during the class. The form also did not provide space or specification to mention how the teacher created the classroom ambience, teacher's manner and style, teacher's tone, teacher's dress, teacher's conduct and how students responded to the teacher throughout the lesson. So in the future, if anybody wishes to do such research "teacher's observation form" needs to be refined and the above mentioned issues need to be incorporated.

From the survey data analysis, we found out that the participants need to be instructed accurately on the technicalities of filling out the questionnaire. In some of the items even with rigorous intervention there was not much improvement in our practices. But paradoxically in participant's reflective journal many said that they excitedly looked forward to the researcher's next session. They also took time to do all the readings and homework given to them.

In the future if anyone wishes to take on such a project, they need to consider the workload to fully dedicate his/her time on such rigorous intervention. If a teacher is teaching more than eight hours a week, doing such action research will be a challenge. In a College such as ours,

U. Tshomo and Lhaden

if the management could assign only eight hours to those who are involved in such research would be most convenient.

# Conclusion

This action research was an adventurous journey for both of us. In trying to take stimulating pedagogy and reinforcement strategies for intervention, we read through lots of literature and it was enriching. The intervention strategies were designed based on the existing literature. We also gained comprehensive insights into the theory of motivation from the literature (Maslow, 1943; Skinner, 2014).

We have learned not just to carry out action research but also to be approachable to our students and listen not just to subject related issues of learners but talk to them about their lives and improve upon this relationship. In the process, we have been able to transform our teaching approach. Thus, we have emerged successfully as "role models" in terms of teacher dress code, tone of spoken language, language and employing various contemporary reinforcers like meditation, music and magic box, which can sustain the curiosity of our learners. We have also improved our SPSS and excel knowledge. As much as the journey of this action research was learning, there are still some difficulties such as improving the survey questionnaire, pretesting and remembering to brief the candidates before they respond to the questionnaire. Finally, we realized that we have not studied how different students respond to different reinforcements. In our next study, we would like to focus on how different learners respond to different reinforcement strategies.

# Acknowledgement

We would like to acknowledge Dr. Kezang Sherab, Dean, RIL for the inception of CAR (Collaborative Action Research) at the College. It is because of his idea that we were motivated to participate. Besides leading the group meticulously, his feedback was critical in shaping our action research report. We would also like to thank the college management for supporting three day writers' retreat which deepened our knowledge into analyzing data, using literature and eventually producing the action research report. We are equally grateful to all the CAR members for helping us with technical hitches and enriching the Action Research journey.

#### **References:**

- Alfred. G. C (2008). Seven strategies for building positive classrooms. Retrieved from http:// www.ascd.org/publications/educational leadership/sept08/vol66/num01/Seven- Strategiesfor-Building-Positive-Classrooms.aspx
- Budden, J. (2011). Using music and songs. Retrieved from http://www.teachingenglish.org. uk/language-assistant/teaching-tips/using-music-songs
- Chai, B. (2012). The Dalai Lama on how meditation can change your life. The Wall Street
- Journal, March 26, 2012. Retrieved from http://blogs.wsj.com/speakeasy/2012/03/26/thedalai-lama-on-how-meditation-can-change-your-life/
- Colleges of Education. (2007). *Handbook for teaching skills and teaching practice*: College of Education, Samtse & Paro, Royal University of Bhutan.

- Conroy, M., Sutherland, K. S., Snyder, A, ., Al-Hendawi, M., & Vo, A. (2009). Creating a positive classroom atmosphere: Teachers' use of effective praise and feedback. *Beyond Behaviour (2)*, (18), 26.
- Curran, C., & the IRIS Center. (2003). *Encouraging appropriate behavior*. Retrieved from http://iris.peabody.vanderbilt.edu/case\_studies/ ICS-005.pdf
- Fischer, J. C. (2001). Open to ideas: developing a framework for your research. In G.
- Burnaford, J. Fischer & D. Hobson (Eds.), Teachers doing research: The power of action through inquiry. New Jersey, USA: LAWRENCE ERLBAUM ASSOCIATES.
- Heffner, L.C. (2014). Reinforcement and reinforcement schedules. Retrived from http:// allpsych.com/psychology101/reinforcement/#.VYEoNUZjYuM
- Hoque., S. R. (2013). Effect of reinforcement on teaching-learing process. *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS)*, 7(1), 13-16. Retrieved from www. Iosrjournals.Org
- Howland, K. (2015). Healthy songs: The amazing power of music therapy. Retrieved from http://theconversation.com/healthy-songs-the-amazing-power-of-music-therapy-37316
- Ihiegblem, O. T., Ihiegbulem, V. N., & Igwebuike, D. (2011). The effect of token economy on academic achievement of secondary school students: Implications for counselling. Proceedings of the 2011 International Conference on Teaching, Learning and Change, Internaltional Association for Teaching and Learning (IATEL). Retrieved from http:// www.hrmars.com/admin/pics/193.pdf
- Mackenzie, N. (2008). Supporting positive behaviour in Alberta schools: A school-wide approach. Edmonton, Alberta: Alberta Education, Learning and Teaching Resources Branch, Retrieved from http://education.alberta.ca/admin/special/resources.aspx
- McLeod, S. A. (2007). Skinner Operant Conditioning, from http://www.simplypsychology. org/operant-conditioning.html
- Newcomer, L. (2009). Universal positive behavior support for the classroom. *PBIS Newsletter*, 4(4).
- Maslow, A. H. (1943). A theory of human motivation. *Psychological Review*, 50, 370-396.
- Peters, L. (2010). Reinforcement in the classroom improves student motivation and performance, BBC. Retrieved from http://www.ttacnews.vcu.edu/2010/01/reinforcementin-the-classroom-improves-student-motivation-and-performance/
- Reeve, J. (2009). *Reinforcement*. Retrieved 10th December, 2014, from http://www.education. com/reference/article/reinforcement/
- Schulte, B. (2015). Harvard neuroscientist: Meditation not only reduces stress, here's how it changes your brain. The Washington Post, May 26, Retrieved from https://www washingtonpost com/news/inspired-life/wp/2015/05/26/harvard-neuroscientist-meditationnot-only reduces-stress-it-literally-changes-your-brain/?tid=hybrid\_experimentrandom\_2\_ na
- Sherab, K. (2013). Strategies for encouraging behavioral and cognitive engagement of preservice student teachers in Bhutan: An action research case study. Educational Action Research, 21:2,164-184.
- Simonsen, B., Fairbanks, S., Briesch, A., Myers, D. &Sugai, G. (2008). Evidence-based practices in classroom management: Considerations for research to practice. *Education* and Treatment of Children, 31(3), 351-380.

U. Tshomo and Lhaden

Skinner, B.F. (1968). The technology of teaching. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts.

Skinner, B.F. (1953). Science and human behaviour. New York: Macmillan.

Skinner, B. F. (1938). *The behavior of organisms: An experimental analysis*. New York: Appleton-Century.

Skinner, B. F. (2014). Science and human behaviour. Retrieved from http://bfskinner.org/store/

- Smith, K. (n.d.). *Positive reinforcement a proactive intervention for the classroom*. U.S: Institute on Community Integration, College of Education, University of Minnesota.
- Tuckman. B, & Monetti. D. (2010). Educational psychology. Retrieved from https://books. google.bt/books

Wikipedia. (2014, 27th August, 2014). Hot seat. Retrieved from http://en.wikipedia.org/ wiki/Hot seat

# Appendix 1

Baseline survey questionnaire on types of reinforcement used by the tutor on her past interaction and teaching with you.

# Paro College of Education Royal University of Bhutan Paro

Age:Class and Program:Gender:Module:

This is to collect **baseline data** on types of reinforcement used by the tutor on her past interaction and teaching with you.

The data collected will be confidential and it will be used only for the Action Research. The final research report will be made available for your reference.

1. The teacher used tangible reinforcements like (tick one that is appropriate).

Stickers	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Certificates	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Tokens( sweets, small gifts)	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Treat	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Marks	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never

2. The teacher used intangible reinforcements (tick the one that is appropriate).

verbal comments	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Smiles/laugh	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Compliments	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Nods	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never

Journal of Educational Action Research

high fives	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Games	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
free time	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
library time	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
assignment time	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Songs	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Dances	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
Jokes	a. often	b. Sometimes	c. never

3. How did such reinforcements impact you personally?

4. The teacher used negative reinforcements such as (tick the one that is appropriate).

.....

U				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		11
Physical Punishments	a.	often	b.	sometimes	c.	never
Sarcasm	a.	often	b.	Sometimes	с.	never
Stare	a.	often	b.	sometimes	c.	never
Scolding	a.	often	b.	Sometimes	с.	never
Shouting	a.	often	b.	sometimes	c.	never
Screaming	a.	often	b.	Sometimes	c.	never

5. How did negative reinforcements affect you?

- .....
- 6. Teacher is very approachable.

a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
----------	--------------	----------

7. Teacher allows students to come to class if he/she is late within 5-10 minutes.

a. often b. sometimes c. never	b. sometimes c. never
--------------------------------	-----------------------

8. Teacher extends assignment dates as per the request of the students.

a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
----------	--------------	----------

9. Teacher uses variety of teaching pedagogy.

a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
----------	--------------	----------

10. Teacher's dress code motivates you.

	a. often	b. sometimes	c. never
--	----------	--------------	----------

11. Teacher's spoken language motivates me.

	a.	often	b.	sometimes	c.	never		
12. Teacher's use of tone motivates me.								

a.	often	b.	sometimes	С.	never

13. The teacher finds time for personal conversation with me?

a. often b. sometimes c	c. never
-------------------------	----------

Given below are the types of positive reinforcements that students receive. Rate a list of reinforcers on a five-point scale to determine which ones you value most. Five being the most important and one being the least important.(the classification below is based on "6Positive Reinforcement used in Alberta Education in Canada, retrieved from Learnalberta.ca on 29/7/14).

Rei	Reinforcers				Scale			
		1	2	3	4	5		
1.	Praise and nonverbal communication (e.g., smile, nod, thumbs up, high five)	1	2	3	4	5		
2.	Social attention (e.g., a conversation, special time with the teacher or a peer)	1	2	3	4	5		
3.	Tangibles such as stickers, new pencils, sweets, treat,	1	2	3	4	5		
4.	Activities or privileges such as playing a game, sitting in a special place in the class, drawing, writing, colouring, going to recess or gym early, having extra computer time, assignment time, assignment extension	1	2	3	4	5		
5.	Teacher as motivating factor( pedagogy, tone, language, dress)	1	2	3	4	5		

Scale 5-Very important, 4-important, 3-moderate, 2-somewhat, 1-least important

# Appendix 2

#### **Observation Form**

Observer :	Date:	
Time	Торіс	
Verbal reinforcement ( mention and keep tally)	Observer's comments	Tutor's comments
Nonverbal reinforcement (mention and keep tally)		

1. ณิศาสารณา อาร์ เคสาร์สา เมอ์รัส ลู้สามา E-mail: penjor.pce@rub.edu.bt

ભગ જેવવે એન્ડ જેગ (Keywords) વજન ગવે જીન્ડ બાદ કરવા બાદ કરવા છે. આ બાદ કરવા આ બાદ કરવા આ બાદ કરવા બાદ કરવા આ બાદ કરવા બાદ કરવા બાદ કરવા આ બ તે ગ

ן<sup>ו</sup>דַ<del>ۇ</del>ֿא<sup>ַ</sup>וּאַשי

*Journal of Educational Action Research* Vol. 1, No. 1, November 2015, 45 - 59 Centre for Educational Research & Development

ષ્યમાં ભોષ તે તે માર તે સુધ્ય સુધ્

नहगःलेन। (Reconnaissance)

શું ભેં ૧૦૦૫ શું ગ્રુ ય યાયય ૯ યાર્સ્તુત ભેષારે માગ્યર્સ્ડ માગ્યર્સ્તુ પ્રાયમાં માર્સ્ટ્ર સાયે રેંગ્ડ્ર પ્રાયર્થ્ય કંત્ર મા ભ મા માસ્યાણ અધવાવે સેંગ સુંદર્ભા સુંદર્ભા સુંદર્ભત ભેષારે ભાષે ૧૦૦ સુંગ સુંત વ્યવસ્ય રેંગ્ડ્રે તે અધવા વર્ષે રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાય સુંદર્ભતા સુંદર્ભતા સાય સાય સુંત્ર સુંત વ્યવસ્ય સુંત સ્વત્ય સ્વ વર્ષે રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાસ્તું રાય સુંદર્ભતા સુંદર્ભતા સુંદર્ભતા સુંત સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત સ્વત્ય સ્વ વર્ષે રાયે સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર પ્રાયત્ય સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર વર્ષે રાયે સુંત્ર સું સુંત્ર સું સ્ટ સું સુંત્ર સ્ય સ્યુત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સ્યત્ય સ્ય સ્યું સ્ય સ્ય સ્યુ સ્યત્ય સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ર સુંત્ય સુંત્ય સુંત સુંત્ર સ્યત્ય સ્ય સ્યત્ય સ્ય સ્યત્ય સુંત્ય સુંત્ય સુંત્ર સુંત્ય સુંત્ય સુંત્ય સુંત્ય સુંત્ય સ્યત્ય સ્ય સ્ય

ทลงมา. คลาร์ทาทิสารอูลารราวติเกษารา ผยวาวกัราลัยาลัราวร์ รลามารู คลาร์ทาทธุ์ทา

ૡૢૻૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼઌૢૻૡૻઌૻૡૻ૱ૡૻૹ૽ૼ૱૱

ริ เฉลิ เล เจ กู จาน ถึง ๆ ภาคา คา เล เล เจ

ଜିସ'ମ୍ବର୍ଚ୍ଚିୟ'କ୍ସି'ୟିଷ୍ୟ

รุ่งกุน.25ชาเช2ชาไ

Journal of Educational Action Research

र्डेंब न्नेश्व न्यु (Literature review) ้ศัทฆรพาก ) "มีรพานานณาสี่รายาสี่ผารู สี่ราวรารีสุพาการสีราวราภัณฑ ณีฑานราทีาลพารัสาวสุท  $\begin{aligned} & \tilde{a}_{1} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{3} \tilde{a}_{4} \tilde{a}_{4} \tilde{a}_{4} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{3} \tilde{a}_{4} \tilde{a}_{5} \tilde{a}_{1} \tilde{a}_{1} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{1} \tilde{a}_{1} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{1} \tilde{a}_{1} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{2} \tilde{a}_{1} \tilde{a}$ 

યર ગાં ગુગાય ના ગાં ગુગાય તે તે આ ગાં ગુગાય છે. આ ગાં ગુગાય તે આ ગાં ગુગાય છે. આ ગાં ગુગાય તે આ ગાં ગુગાય તે આ ગ तकर गति की तर तेवन तर्हे वाय र गीर्दे तथा पर की दे तथा र के की तथा की



স্ট্রিশাশ্বশ্বদা(Competence) ૡ૽ૢ૾ૼૺૼૼૼૼૺઌ૽ૻઌૻૻૻઽઽૡૢૺ૾ૼૣઌૣਗ਼ૡૺૡ૽ૢૡ૽ૺઌૡૼૼૺૡૻૻૹ૽ૺૢૻૹ૾ૢૢ૽ૼઽઌૻૻૣઽૻૻૻૡૢૼૼ૾૽ૼૼૼૼૼૼઌૡૻઽૣઌૻૻઌૻૻૡૻૻ૱ૡ૽ૻૡૻ૽ૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ ઽૺૡૻૹ૽ૼૼઽૹૡ૽ૺઌૣૹૣૻઌૺૡૡ૾૾ઌૡૼૼૡૻૹ૽ૺૢૻૹ૾ૢૢૢૺૼૼઽૡૼૡૼ૾ૡ૿ઽૼૹૣઽૡૡૡૻૼઽૡૡૼૡૼૡૼ૱ૹૢઽૺૹૄૣૣૣૣૢઽૡઌઽૡ૽ૡૺૡૣૡૢૻૡૼઽ૾ૡ૱ૡ અર ગાંદ્ર ગાય કે તે માં સૂન આપર કે ન છે દેન્ ન સુચા સું છે બે 1000 માં સુચાર કે પ્રાપ્ત કે ન બે સે સે ગા ગાંદ્ ગા આગા ગાલ રે આ ગામ આ ગા ૡૻૺ૽ૼૢૻૺ૽૿૽ૹ૽ૣૼ૱ૢૢૢૢૢૢૢૢૢૢૹૻૻૹ૾૾ૢૹૻૻઌૡ૽૾ૡૢ૽ઽૻૻૣ૽ૻ૽ૼૼૻૼૡૻૻૹ૾ૣૼ૱ૹ૾ૣૢૢૢૢૼૼઽૻઌૡ૽૿ૺૼૼૼૡઌ૾ૻૣ૽ઌ૽ૡ૾૾ૡ૾૾ૼૡૻ૾૽૽૾ૢ૽ઌ૾ૹૼૡઌ૾ૢ૾ૡ૾૾ઌ૾૾ૡ૾૾ૡૡ૾૾૱ૻ૾ૡ૱ૻ૾ พิ วิ่านุกาษาณฑา ณฑาณิสาติกานสัญานการการการบิ่าแล่าญ่ฑุสารกานติญาริ ติกานสัญานร์ นุกร่า สู่ทุญ วิ่าปลุมาลิ่า ดีนานสิ้นเฉาาอนามาที่รัทพามาสู่เพา ลี่นาวันสาลีนาลีรานนารมานหา ૡૻ૽ૼઽૻૻઽ૾ૡૢઽૻૡ૾ૻૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૻઌૣૻૡૻઌૣ૱ૡૢૼ૱૽ૼૼઌૻૼૹૢ૽ૺ૾ૡ૾૾ઌૻૹૻ૾ૼઌૻૹ૽૿ઌૣ૱ૼૻૻ૱ૡ૱ૻૻ૱ૡૻઌૼૡૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼઌૼૡૻૹ૾ૣૼઌ૾ૻૡૻ૱ૡ૾ૻ૱૾ૻૡૼ

รุสพาสฏิ์ม

Schermerhorn  $\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} McLaughlin (1997) = \exists x : ali : ຫຼື ali : ເຊິ່ງ : ເຊິ່ງ : ເຊິ່ງ : McLaughlin (1997) = ax : ali : ເຊິ່ງ : ເຊ$ 

મું વર્ષે મેં દેવાયું જેવા ત્ર્યો કેવા ગાવડ સુરા તરી કે શું ખેં 4094 શું સુન્યત્વે કે જા હયું ખેવ ખા રે ખાર અરાકે વે જા છે જા વર્દે ભાગ તવર સે જો કે બા રુ બા રુ બા રુ બા રુ બા રુ બા રે જો જો રુ બા ર સે જો જો બા રુ સે બા રુ સે બા રુ બા રે બા રુ બા રે બા રુ બા રે બા રુ બા રુ બા રુ બા રે બા રુ બા રુ બા રે બા રે બા રુ બા રે બા રુ બા રુ બા રે બા રે બા રુ બા રે બા રે બા રે બા રુ બા રે બા રે બા રે બા રુ બા રે બા રે બા રે બા રુ બા રુ બા રે બા રે

รุสญ.ชฏิ์ม

ฃ่าง ์ตามิ คาร์สามิ ญ่ายู่หารา มีกาชีๆ ที่ มีการ ที่นาวกราวมี สู่ๆมามิ เมาะมีรุ่นางใสมา ๆสรายู้ร่าริ

tion)

प्र्योर्भेगागवर्षा क्षुनुर्ग्धे नुद्धे नुद्धनुर्प्रमेलान्मनु। (Analysis of baseline data and interpreta-



Journal of Educational Action Research

ทหงุณนา รูญาฐิสาลิสาษิสานารานนาลิสานารลิสาษิสานที่เมาปรูทพานนาริหา พรามา

_	<u></u>								
	พรๅ	ৠয়ৼ৾৾ঽ৸৾৾য়৾৴য়	૿૾૾૾૾૾૾ૡ૽ૻ૾ૻૡ૽૾ૺ૱૿ૡ૽૾ૡ૽૿૱ૻ૾ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ૽૿ૡ	র্শির্নিবা					
	1	ਗੁ'ਕਸੇਂ5੍ਰਿਤੁੱਟਾਪ	<b>ૹૄ</b> ૼ:ઌૹ૽ૢ૾ૺૼૢૼૹ૽ૢૢૢૢૢૢૢૢૢૼૼૢૡૢ	ૹ૾ૢૢૼઽઌૣૻ૽ૼૼ૱ૡઌઽૢૼૡૼઽૡઽૢૡૻૹ૾ૣૼઽૡઌઽૡ૽૾ૡ૽૾ૺ૱ૡૣ					
	٩	ন্দ্র্যা:5	মহ্যা'নস্থা	ૹ૾ૣૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૻૠૢૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૼૻૻ૱ૡૢૻૼૻૻૼ૱ૻ૾ૼૡૻ					

שחויתאו גנו שחואקיב גיב בויאיב גע

ณฑาณิสายกละพิพ (Intervention) . બેલ કે સુન મેં નર્વો પર, ડુય સુંત છે જોન સેલ ન ન વસે બાક સેન ખર સુય ગાઠ કે તે સ્વય બાય બે બે નર્કે લ ખેન นลิสรานพารรรมสร้านที่เริ่มๆ ที่สราชูรารษูรายหูานิสาสรรธรรสมเล็มเนพี่ ที่สราชูราญที่ดารค่า หร้ามร้า อ้ารรณสมารณ์นลารายการรับที่เห็นการสาราย เป็นการสารสาราย เริ่มเลื่อง เกาะสาราชานที่ เรื่อง เราะ <sup>ૹૻ</sup>ૡ૽ૼૡ૽૽૽૾ૢૢ૽ૼ૾ૺૡ૾૽ઌૻ૽ઌ૾ૻૡ૽ૻઌૻ૱ૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૼૡૻ૽ૡ૽ૼૡ૽ૻઌ૽ૼૡ૽ૻૡૡ૱ૡ૽ૻૡ૽૾ૡૡ૱ૡ૱ૡ૱

. શુ. ગાનુરુ વોર્ગ તે છે. તે

พรรรจิฑาล์ษาพัรษานารารัสานสีสาอรพ์ ๆ พรรรมรานราญาตติ เรต่าหรู ซึ่งานราฐสายุรรสินร์ สา

ૹઽૻ૾ૹ૱૾ૻૡ૱ૻૹ૾ૣઌૻૻૡઽૻૡ૾ૺૻ૾ૹૼૡૻૡૹૢ૱ૡ૽૿૱ૡૻઌૻૹ૱ૡ૾ૻૡ૱ૡૻ



รุสญ.เนยู์ม



<sup>ૺ</sup> શ્વા હિલા. આ સેવા. ને ગ સેવાના અપ્ર પ્ર પ્ર પ્ર પ્ર પ્ર પ્ર પ્ર પ્ર પ્ર							
สู้จาริส	र्नेव <sup>.क्</sup> वा	ૹ૾ૄૢૼૼઽઌૣૡ૽ૺૹઽႃ	ৠ৾৾৴ৼ৾৾ৠ৾ য়৾৾৽য়৾৾৴য়৾	<sup>ઐત્ર</sup> 'ર્ઠમ' ૬'અ'ર્યોભ્રા	र्गे'र्नेना		

ଦିଽଽୖ୶ୖ୵ୡ୳୵୳ୠୢ୕ୄ୴ୄୖୢୖୠୖ<sup>୲</sup> ୖୖୖୖ୴୩ୄ୕ୖୖୢୖୖୖୖୖୄ୴୳ଽୡ୳ୖୣ୵୳୕ୡ୕୵ୖୢଌ୕୲୰୲ୖୄ୳୵୳୕ୄୠ୕ୄ୩୲ୖୠ ୳ୖୖ୶୕୳ୖFitzgerald (2001) ୩ୡ୳୰ୖ୩୵ୖଽ୕୳୴ୄୢ୕ୠ୶ୖୢୖୄୠୖ ୩ଽ୶୵୵ଽୖଌ୕୩୲ଌ୕ଽ୶୲ୡ୳ଽ୳ଽୡୖୢ୲ଌ୳୶ୖୢୄୢୖ୴ୖଽ୕୶ୄୣଊୄୖୢୢୢୖୢୢୢଈୖଽ୷ଌ୕୶ୣ୵୵ୡୖୣଌ୴୳ୖୖୡ୵ୡ୴୲ୖୄୣୣୣୣୣ୵୳୲ୡ୵ୡଌ୳ୖୄୡ୵ୖୄ୵୴ୄୢଌୡ୲ୖୢୡ୲ୖୢଌୄ୶୲୴ ଽୄୖ୶୵ଌ୕୶୲ୖ୩୲ୖଽ୶ଽ୵୳ୠୄ୴ୢୖୠ୲ୖୠ୲୳ୠଽୡୢଽୠୢୠ୲ୖୠ ୠୢୖ୲ଌ୕୲୳୵ୗୄ୵୲ୡ୳୵୳ୠୄୠ୲ୄୖୠ୲୴ୗୠ୲ଽୠ୲ୡୠୡୠୠୠୠ

Journal of Educational Action Research

ત્રેન્ડ્રસ્ટ માત્ર મુદ્ધાનું છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરેન્ડ છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરેન્ડ છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ આવે છે. આ ગુણ પ્રાપ્ત કરે છે. આ ગુ

য়ৢৢৢৢৢৢৢৢৢৢৢৢৢৢৢয়ৢৢৢয়ৢৢ

# 

ารางการกู้มา

สูษาทธิทาทาริรา ผู้อาณารังรา อรูสายทาทธิทาสราชราทธิพารา พยาวาทัศราผู้อาผู้อารู้อารู้สารูพา



ୖୖୖଌ୩''ୟམ'ୢ୶୳୲ <b>୵୳ୖ୲</b> ୖଌ୩'ୄ୵୵ୄୄୖୠୖ୴୶ୖ୶ୡ୕ୄ୵ୖୄୖୄ୰୲୩'୳ୄୄୡୣ୵୲							
ञ्चे:र्कवा		भुगव्य ५-११ पर्रः दार्घपान्ध्य	স্নুগম্ম <i>१९-१७</i> মম:ব:র্টন' মা	স্নুশ <sup>ম</sup> १५- १ <b>३</b> प्र <b>२:</b> ठ:र्छेप: श्री	સુગમ્ય ૧૯- ૧૯ વર:વ:ર્ਬન:સા	শ্নুগাশ্ব:40 ইন্দ:ম	
	दर्गे <sup>:</sup> र्चेग'गव <u>्</u> र-शुरा	e)م.و	J0.24	าข.แก	3.93	0.00	
শ	ૡૢૡૻૻૡૡ૽ૺૹૻૻૡ૱ૻૹૢઽૣ	0.00	२.०७	<i>વલ.૧</i> ૫	ષ.૫૯	0.00	
	त्र्यो <sup>.</sup> ईयाःगवनः श्रुन	9.pls	20.24	1ર્સ.થેસ્	6.64	0.00	
ГЛ	. બુ <sup>ત્ય અ</sup> ત્રે ગાવચ સુરા	0.00	२.०६	५.७६	נט.קנ	J.pls	
_	त्र्यो <sup>:</sup> र्घेगाःगवनःश्चन।	૯.૧૫	19.40	99.Cl	3.93	0.00	
শ	સુભા અવે ગાવચા સુગ	<b>३</b> .१३	11.Cl	90.69	ર્લલ	0.00	

5 .9 <u>م</u>

Journal of Educational Action Research

ดิจารสั้ณ'ขั้พ'รรุณ|(Recommendation) จะสูง ซัม นารรุทาร สิราว (ศิทา ขารง นา) "ณิทุง นาณจายรามขั้ยทุง <sub>น</sub>ายรี่ แม่ขัยทุง นาณจา ขระวัฐมงนายาร์ แร้งมง นาณจายกรุทาน ทร์ แร้ว นายาร์ เรื่ารรมขัยทุง <sub>น</sub>ายรี่ แม่ขัยทุง นาณจา สิ่า ณิ ขารสาน นายา แล้ว นายาม นายาร์ เมื่อมาง นายาม เมื่อมา แล้ว เมือง เมือง เมือง เมือง สิ่า ณิ ขารสาน นายา เมือง นายา นายา เมือง เม เมือง เมือง

यगायमार्थ्या प्रगायगार्द्र युग्यस्य मेवर् केर् युग्यस्य युग्धर्म्य								
ङ्ये:क्वी	पर्मे र्चेग गवन शुरा	<sup>ઌ</sup> ૢૢૢૢઌૻૻૻૹૡ૽ૻ૽ૻૹ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽	<u>୴</u> ᠽ᠄᠊᠋᠊ᢆᡀᢩᢂ᠂ᠭᢆᢧ᠂ᡦᢧ᠋ᠫ᠂ᠴᠴ					
ग	14.ac%	12.36%	1.6%					
찌	૧૫.૯૯%	20.6D%	4.01%					
শ	16.30%	<u> 16.90%</u>	1.41%					

ฃิพารัฐฟาขิ เอานา เาพารี่มานาร์สี่งารีที่พาร์ที่ สู่มีพายพ

ารางการกู้มา

ฑิ่พ<sup>ิ</sup>พสาร์ฑ<sub>พ</sub>พั่รุ ฺฺฺฺมิรฺฑิฺฺฺฑิลิฅา๛ิ์ตาตร์ดาร์กรุ่ม ๖ฑฺ ฺพ ัมร์รัๅ ริวันว<sub>ี่ว</sub>ห่านพ<sup>.</sup> ร<sup>ุ</sup>ฑิพ<sup>.</sup>พิฑ<sup>.</sup>ฺฺฐิว<sub>ี</sub>ฑิวั*ร*ุฑุ่นระณ<sup>.</sup>ฺพิณ<sup>.</sup>ฆิวฺพิณ<sup>.</sup>ฃิว<sub>ี</sub>พิฑ<sup>.</sup>พิพ. นทิ ซิภาพ. นทิ ซิภาพ. য়ঀয়ৼয়ৣ৴৽ঀয়ৣ৽৾ঀঀয়৽৾৸য়৽য়ঀ৾৾ঀ৾ৼয়ৣঀ৾৾ঀ৴ৼ৾য়য়৾য়৽ঢ়৾৽য়ঀয়৽ঀয়৽ঀয়৽য়ঀ৾য়৾য়ঀ৾য়৾য়৾য়য়য়৾ড়৾য়৾য়৾য়৾য়৾

মন্থনা নম্থা (Conclusion) ૹ૾ઽૹૣઽ઼઼૾૾ૼૡૼૻ૱૱૽૿ૢ૽ૻઌૡ૿ૺ૽ૢૢ૽ૢ૽ૼ૱ૡઌઽૻૻ૾૱ૹ૾ૣૺ૱ૹ૾ૣૢૺૼૼૼઽૻઌઙ૾૾૱ૡ૾ૻૡૡ૽૿ૡ૽૾ૡ૽૾ૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽૿ૡ૾૾ૡ૾૾ૡ૾૽ૡ૽ૻૡ૽૿ૡ૾૾ૡ૾૾ૡ૾૽ૡ૽ૻૡ <u>ૺ</u>ૡૢૼૡૹૡૡ૽૾ૼૺ૾૽ૼૡ૽૿ૡૺૢૻ<sup>૾</sup>ૹ૾ૡઌૹૡૢૼૹૻૢૼૡૻૻઽૼૻૹૻૢ૾ૼૡૡૡ૽ૡ૽ૼૻૢૡૢ૾ૢ૽ૡૢૢૢૢૻૡૡ૽ૡ૽ૡ૽ૻ૱૱ૡૻૡૼૡૻ૱૱ૡૻૡૼ૱૱ૡૻૼૼૼૻૹૡૹૡૡ૱ૡ૽ૼ

ୖଵୣୖୖୖ୴୲୵ୡୖୖଌ୕ୖୖ୴ୄୖୖୄୄୄୖୄୖ୴ୖ୳ୖ୶ୠୄ୵୵୵୵ୡୖଢ଼୴ୄୖୄ୶ୖ୳୵ୡୖୖ୶୷ୄୖୖୄ୷୲୴ୄୖୄୖ୴୲୴ୖୄ୲୲ୖ୶୲ଽଵ୵୶ୖୠ୶୲୵ୠୄୖୖ୷୷୲୲ୠ୲୷ୠ୲୷ୠୄୖ 

ૡર્વે કેંગાં ગુર્વત્ર સુત્ર બાય અલે ગું વર્ષ સુત્ર વત્ર અને પ્રત્ય કે કે બેર્ડુ ગાં ને વન્ન સંબંધ લેન વર્દેવા વન્ને કે વન્ન સંદેશ વન્ને કે વન્ને સંદેશ વન્ને કે વન્ને સંદેશ વને સંદેશ વન્ને સંદેશ વન્ને સંદેશ વન્ને સંદેશ વન્ને સંદેશ વન્ને સંદેશ વને સંદેશ વન્ને સંદેશ વન્ને સંદેશ વને સ સંદેશ સંદે સ <u>નુવે.ન.નસ્પે.જ.</u>થોઝો ๅ ๚ลูล ลิ ลิ์น ที่นายาลิ เสลาทุญลาธารุ นิสา พราฐญาซิ สา ทิตาลตารทุญาติสา พราติสามนา ลูทานรา

ลิจ สส้ญ สราวสรีสุ (Limitations) 

# ୵ୖଈ୕୕ୖୖ୶୲ୖୄୄ୶ୄୖୄଐ୶୶ୄୖୄୠୄ୕ୄୣ୶୲୶୲୳୶୲

ญาต์ดิ่านด่ทาลิ่า ลิ่นา่ทางยู้ตางาวชั้นาลาสิ่าว่าวิริสังท์วิริสุมานงงา พิตาลิ่นารท่านจึงาว่าว่าจูตนา รา สู้นารัฐการพันการอาศีพาซิพาฐ์นาณิรัฐานการ์ทางพา กรณะพาทร์ทางนาณพา ยนพาศิพาณ์ ที่พาพิทาษ์นา

૿૾૿૿૽ગ્;ૡૢૼ૽ૻૡ૽૾ૣ૽ૼૹ૽ૺઙૺૻૻૢૻ૱૽ૢૻૢ૽૱૽ૡૢ૽૱ૡઌૻૻૡઌ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡઌ૽ૻૡૡ૽ૻૡૡૡ ૡાર્ટેનુ વેન્દ્રખાય વર્ઢે ભાને વર્સા નસુયા મારે તે રે ગીય ખાન સેવ ખાન સુયા યાનન તે ભુખ વે સેવાય ખાય

ᢩᢆᢩ᠍ᡷ᠋ᡇ᠈ᢅᢩ᠊ᢋᠴᡎ᠋ᢆ᠋ᡎ᠆ᠴ᠋ᠵ᠋ᡇᡃ᠍ᢖᡄᡃᡇ᠆ᠵᢆᡃ᠋ᡎᡃᡱᡧ᠋᠆ᠴᢩᢙᢩᡣᢪᢩᢢ᠂᠋᠋᠆ᡷᢩᡩ᠆ᡪ᠋᠋᠋ᡎ᠇ᠴ᠋ᡷᡧ᠋ᠬᡘᠴ᠆ᠴᢩᢌᢩᠬᡃᢩᢢ᠄ ᠋ᡭᡆ᠋ᡃᢩ᠈ᡷᡇ᠆᠋᠋ᠴ᠋ᢩᡆ᠆ᡗᢩᢇ᠂ᢋᢩᠵ ᠌ᢩ᠍ᡸᠴ᠈᠋ᡏ᠋᠋᠋᠆ᠴᢩᢌᡎᡃᡅ᠈ᢒ᠋ᢋ᠂ᢩ᠋᠋᠋᠋᠋᠊ᡎ᠉ᡭᡆ᠋᠋᠈ᢩᡷᡆ᠆ᡪᢩ᠋᠊᠋᠋᠊᠋ᢩ᠋᠆ᠵ᠋ᡢ᠋ᡎ᠋ᠮ᠋ᠶ᠆ᠺᡀ᠉ᡆᡘ᠍᠍᠍ᠮ᠋ᡎ᠋ᢂ᠉ᡬ᠆ᡅᡘ᠋ᡆ᠆ᠺᡭᡆ᠋᠋᠋᠆ᠴᢋᢋ᠆ᡗᡆ᠈ᡘ᠋ᢩ᠆

Journal of Educational Action Research

ૻઽૢઽૻ<sup>੶</sup>૱ૹૡઽૻૢૡૢઽૢૻૢ૾ઌૣૻૣ૾ૢૢૡૢૻૻ૽ઌ૽૿ૢૹૢ૿ૣઌૻૡ૱ૹૻૡૼઽૡૢૡૺઽૼૻૹ૾ૣૼઌૻૻૻૡઽૹ૾ૣૺૼ૾૾ૼૼૻ૾ૼૡૼૡૻૻૡ૾૾ૢૼૹૻ য়৾৾ঽ৾য়৾য়৾৾৽ৼ৾৾৾ৼয়য়৾৽ঀয়৾৾ঀয়৾৾৾য় রুর্দ্দ আরু আরু প্রী প্র আ ব'অব্ধ'বেব্দ

રે'ક્ષે'ખર'ક્તુર્ય'ગ્રૈ'વગ્રુ્ર-'વ'ગ્રુ-'સે'ને'ખર' Nayak and Rao (2009, p.163.)ગેય' ભ્રુન'સે'ર્જુ'ભુ ઙૻૢૼૼૼૼૹૹ<sup>ૻ</sup>૾ૺૹૢ૽ૼૼૼૼૼૼૼઽૡ૽ઽૻઌઙૢૼઌૼૹઙઌ૽ૼૡૻ૽ૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૼૡૻ૾ૡ૽ૼૡૻ૽ૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૻૡ૽ૼૡૻૢૻૡૻૡૻૡૻૡૻૡૻૡૻૡૻૡૻૡૻૡ૾ૡ૽ૡ૽ૡૡૡૡ૽ૼૡૻ૽ૡૻ૽ૡ૽ૻૡ <u>૨ે ૡ૱ઽૹ</u>ૡૹૻૡ૾૱ૡૹૼૡૡ૱ઌૡ૱૱ૡૡ૱૱ૡૡ૱૱ૡ૱૱૱૱૱૱૱૱

# নশীর দশক কিঁন

રેવા વાર્ફુવા બવા વાલે રેચ સુર મ બેં મેં જ મારે જે સંતર પાલ વા વાશ્વય છે સુંત સું ર માં જ બવા સ્વા નહત્રસ્ય ગુદેવસ્ય ગુરુષ ગુરુ *৻*৻ড়ৢ৻৸৻ৼ৾৻৾৶৾৾ৼ৾য়৾৻য়৾৻য়৾৻য়৾৾৻য়৾৾৻য়৾৾৾ શું ર્શ્વેન સેંન્પ રે રે ન લેવે રુ ભુ ન યોવ ર થાવ જે ર ખેતી

વર્સુય સે લેવાવર્દ્વેવાવર્દ્વે લુવાન ગાગવત્વો સાર્વે અર્ઘે દેવાર્સુવા ચુવે લેવાવર્દ્વવાસ્ત્રી ગ ขี้ทุฬาสมพาพย์ราทุสรามา พาส์าพษ์าริมาผู้กาฆุณิ ดีกาณชึ้ญาณที่ารุนัสา รามิภายานาญาพรา รุทุณ ፚ፝፟፞፞፞፞፞፞፞፞፞ጞ፧፝፞፞፞፞ ጛ፟፞፝፞ጘ<sup>ኯ</sup>፝ቚጞፙ

ज्रुन हेव न्ये हें।

- ૡદૈષશ્વચાયે બેચર્સુ (દ્વસાયત) ત્વાયોવા અને સ્વસ્થયન્ ત્વાત્ર હવા સંગ્રીય સાથતા વિસ્વર્ય સંગ્રીય સાથતા સાથવા સાથળા સ নন্ত্রশাঝ র্মা
- न्हरूअः उवं न्युं अग्यतेः हैं। (१००८) नगातः गवनः गर्यया यतिः से ग्वेन्गी सः यान्तरः यो वायाः यत्यु मयाः व्यु मय The Corporate Body of the Buddha Education Foundation, Taiwan.

- Cresswell, J. W. (2007). Qualitative inquiry and resaerch design: Choosing among five

- approaches (2<sup>nd</sup> edition). California: Sage Publication.
- Follansbee, R. (2000). Speaking to write: Realizing the potential of speech recognition for secondary students with disabilities, Retrieved from: http://www.edc.org/spk2wrt/bob.
- html. Fulk, B. (1997). Think while you spell: A cognitive motivationa approach to spelling Instruction: Teaching Exceptional Children. Retrieved from http://search.proquest.com.
- ezproxy.library.uq.... Nayak, A.K. & Rao, V.K. (2009). Classroom teaching: Methods and Practices. New Delhi:
- APH Publishing Corporation.
- Sakamoto, B. (nd). How important is lesson planning? Retrieved from: http://itdi.pro/

blog/2012/05/28/how-important-is-lesson-planning-barbara-sakamoto/

Schermerhorn, P. K., & McLaughlin, T. F. (1997). Effects of the add-a-word spelling program on test accuracy, grades, and retention of spelling words with fifth and sixth grade regular education students. *Child & Family Behavior Therapy*, 19(1), 23-35.

Sherab, K. (2013) Strategies for encouraging behavioural and cognitive engagement of preservice student-teachers in Bhutan: An action research case study, *Educational Action Research*, 21:2, 164-18 Journal of Educational Action Research Vol. 1, No. 1, November 2015, 60 - 69

#### **A Sample Action Research Proposal**

# Ways to Actively Engage Bhutanese Pre-Service Student Teachers in their Curriculum Studies Classes: Plans for an Action Research Case Study

Kezang Sherab<sup>1</sup>

#### Introduction

Action research is understood as the systematic processes of inquiry aimed at bringing improvement in one's own practices, in the situation or both (Grundy, 1995; Stringer, 2004; Davies et al., 2014). According to Kemmis (2009, p.463) "action research aims at changing three things: practitioners' *practices*, their *understandings* of their practices, and the *conditions* in which they practise." It is a cyclical research process that involves reconnaissance, planning, action, observation, collecting evidence, and reflection (Grundy, 1995; Maxwell, 2003; Kemmis & McTaggart, 2005). Action research, especially classroom action research, has been more prominently used in the teaching community as a means for critical reflection and professional development of teachers (Grundy, 1995; Kemmis & McTaggart, 2005; Tillapaugh & Haber-Curran, 2013; Cain & Harris, 2014). As a result it helps teachers to bring about innovations in their daily task of teaching with the attempt to make an impact on the students' learning.

Teaching at the university level is largely teacher dominated with minimal student engagement in the teaching-learning process (Tillapaugh & Haber-Curran, 2013). Such an approach needs to be reexamined, as it does not promote involvement of students in the learning process. Research indicates that, active involvement of students in the learning process can positively impact upon student achievement (The Centre for Comprehensive School Reform and Improvement, 2007; Uztosun & Cadorath 2014). Therefore, considering the important role student engagement plays, this action research is designed to examine my own teaching practices in bringing about improvement to student engagement during the learning process.

#### Reconnaissance

According to Grundy, (1995, p. 13) "reconnaissance often consists in going backwards and forwards for a while between reflections and collecting evidence". It involves a careful analysis of the researcher's own competence, the situation that the researcher wants to study, and a detailed review of related literature (Maxwell, 2003) that leads to the design of an action research question. These three components of reconnaissance are discussed below.

# Competence

Although I have not done any action research in the past, I have conducted some other forms of social science research. However, with the completion of the action research course as

<sup>1.</sup> Sr. Lecturer, Dean RIL, CERD, E-mail: kezangsherab.pce@rub.edu.bt

a recipient of the AusAid Australian Leadership Award Fellowship, I have gained some knowledge on action research. The last ten years of experience as a teacher educator provided a good opportunity for me to re-examine the trend of student engagement in my pre-service teacher education classes and helped me improve upon it. Engagement is a critical issue when it comes to student learning. This Fellowship also provided an opportunity to look at the existing literature in the well-established university library.

#### Situational Analysis

During my ten years of experience as a teacher educator teaching various subjects such as health and physical education, teaching skills and research modules, I have observed that the pre-service student teachers are generally reluctant to engage in the teaching-learning process. Often teachers have to literally ask students to say something or have to prod them to answer a question. Discussion with colleagues indicates that this is also a problem for them. Pre-service student teachers often shy away and seldom contribute to the class discussions. Therefore, student engagement in the Bhutanese teacher education classrooms seems to be very low, and as a result can affect student learning. Research (e.g, Cothran & Ennis, 2000; Smith, Sheppard, Johnson & Johnson, 2005; Yazzie-Mintz, 2006) has shown that teachers have to involve students actively to promote student learning. Literature also indicates that without adequate student engagement even the best quality curriculum and quality teacher cannot achieve the maximum benefit intended for learning (Cothran & Ennis, 2000).

This problem has become more apparent specially after having had the opportunity to coteach with some international volunteers from the United States, Japan, and Australia over the last few years. These volunteers have always felt that the Bhutanese pre-service student teachers do not actively participate in their classes.

From all these experiences, I have realised that this issue deserved some immediate attention. In the teaching-learning process, students are often held responsible for such behaviour and as such educators rarely realise that they share the responsibility too. Research elsewhere has demonstrated that it is the teacher's way of teaching that fosters active student engagement, which brings about meaningful learning in the students (Carini, Kuh, & Klein, 2006; Smith, Shepherd, Johnson & Johnson, 2005; Cothran & Ennis, 2000). There is a strong possibility that this is a cultural phenomenon but no research has been conducted in the Bhutanese context to examine student engagement or an attempt made to improve upon it.

#### **Barriers to Engagement from the Bhutanese Perspectives**

Some preliminary analysis of the pre-service student teachers' engagement in Bhutanese classes indicates that there are some contextual barriers to active student engagement. While there could be many reasons for the lack of student engagement in the class discussions, this action research is designed to focus on the cultural aspect of it. Especially in the Bhutanese context, I strongly think that cultural and language barriers would be the two major stumbling blocks for student engagement. However, this claim will need to be confirmed through the collection and analysis of base-line data. Each of these barriers is briefly discussed below.

# Language Barrier

The medium of instruction in the schools and colleges in Bhutan is English. For many students,

K. Sherab

English is their second language and for others it is their third language. As second or third language speakers, our students are not very good with the language, nor are they confident at communicating in English. They feel apprehensive that if they make a mistake their friends would make fun of them. I strongly feel that as a result of these barriers, they have developed a habit of not contributing to the class discussions. Therefore, this action research involves developing strategies to win the hearts of students and helping them develop confidence in themselves to speak out in the class. While it is a challenging task, our pre-service student teachers need to realise that getting over these language barriers is important for them as future teachers.

# **Cultural Barrier**

A Professor at one of the Universities abroad had something important to share about his dealings with Bhutanese students. Whenever the Professor asked a question to a group of Bhutanese students, he observed that all members in a group would look at, or wait for a senior member to respond. Yes, in the Bhutanese context of our culture we always respect a senior member or a teacher and look upon him or her as a source of knowledge and inspiration. Children for instance will never intervene in a conversation between their parents or with some other elderly people. Our students always consider their teachers to be the ultimate source of knowledge and that learning can take place only in the presence of a teacher. Although we do not have a senior or a junior student in the classroom context, Bhutanese students have been quite used to keeping quiet especially at the tertiary level. Such practices have been going on for quite a long time and not much innovation has been evident. Now that the 21<sup>st</sup> century landscape is changing at a rapid speed, we need to bring about innovations and do away with such age-old traditional practices.

Although these are some of the assumptions at the moment, this action research intends to gather some concrete data for evidence. If it holds true, how I can eliminate these barriers to student engagement will be the main task of this action research.

For a complete situational analysis, a base-line data will be gathered and analysed in order to understand the trend of student engagement in my classes. Based on these data, intervention plans for improvement will be generated. Base-line data will also be used for comparison with the results of student engagement after the implementation of the plans of action.

### Literature Review

This section builds upon some of the ideas above already woven into the discussion about the situation concerning student engagement in Bhutan. It begins with a discussion on the concept of student engagement. According to Yazzie-Mintz (2006, p.1) student engagement is:

The student's relationship with the school community: the people (adults and peers), the structures (rules, facilities and schedules), the curriculum and content, the pedagogy, and the opportunities (curricular, co-curricular, and extra-curricular).

From this statement it is quite clear that student engagement involves a wide connotation which covers all aspects of schooling life. However, Willms's (2003, p. 8) definition of student engagement is also quite broad:

Engagement is seen as a disposition towards learning, working with others and functioning in a social institution, which is expressed in students' feelings that they belong at school, and in their participation in school activities.

Quite similar to the first definition, Willms also encompasses a broader view of engagement, which is beyond the scope of this small-scale action research. However, the definitions are instructive in that engagement in classroom learning is related to other kinds of institutional and community engagement. According to the English Oxford dictionary in the context of students, engagement refers to "commitment" or "participation" or "involvement". Therefore, the focus of this research will be on classroom engagement that can promote classroom student learning. Fredricks, Blumenfeld and Paris (2004) provide a very comprehensive discussion of student engagement under three broad components: behavioural engagement, emotional engagement and cognitive engagement. These authors (2004) present definitions for each of the engagement components:

Emotional engagement refers to students' affective reactions in the classroom, including interest, boredom, happiness, sadness, and anxiety. Cognitive engagement refers to psychological investment in learning, a desire to go beyond the requirements and a preference for challenge. (p. 63)

Within this multifaceted nature of engagement, behavioural engagement has been further subdivided into three distinct definitions:

The first definition entails positive conduct, such as following the rules and adhering to classroom norms, as well as the absence of disruptive behaviours such as skipping school and getting in trouble. The second definition concerns involvement in learning and academic tasks and includes behaviours such as effort, persistence, concentration, attention, asking questions, and contributing to class discussion. The third definition involves participation in school related activities such as athletics or school governance. (p. 62)

Cognitive engagement in the classroom has been defined as, "psychological investment required for comprehending and mastering knowledge and skills" (Wehlagee, Rutter, Smith, Lesko, & Fernandez, 1939 as cited in Cothran and Ennis, 2000, p. 106). From this we can understand that if teachers want their students to derive utmost benefit out of their teaching, they need to have students who make a psychological investment in their learning activities.

The crucial role classroom engagement plays in the education of a student has been recognised by many researchers (Milne & Otieno, 2007; Carini, Kuh, & Klein, 2006; Setzer, 2006; Smith, Shepherd, Johnson & Johnson, 2005; Kuh, 2001; Cothran & Ennis, 2000). A review of the literature indicates that without adequate student engagement even a quality curriculum and quality teacher will not achieve maximum benefit intended for learning (Cothran & Ennis, 2000). As a teacher educator, I have realised that it is essential to actively engage students in the learning process although I have not been able to fully realise this principle in practice. Cothran and Ennis (2000, p. 111) suggest that teachers have to be the "primary energy

K. Sherab

source in creating an educationally engaging environment." Teachers do play an important role but students also have to make an effort in this difficult process. If students are not ready and motivated, any teacher effort will not foster learning in students. Furthermore, Cothran and Ennis (2000) also suggest that "engaging teachers were those who communicated, cared, and enthusiastically presented active learning opportunities" (p. 111). This means that as an action researcher, I will have to investigate my own actions to see if I really communicate, care, and provide active learning opportunities for my students. What I need to do is communicate clearly, demonstrate care for my students and provide active learning opportunities. Therefore, this study is designed to look at the kind of gap that exists in my teaching-learning processes and more importantly to identify alternative solutions to eliminate the gap.

However, it is also beyond the scope of this small-scale action research to address all aspects of classroom engagement. As per the definition presented above, this action research will particularly examine students' cognitive engagement in the classroom and the second definition of the behavioural engagement which states, "involvement in learning and academic tasks and includes behaviours such as effort, persistence, concentration, attention, asking questions, and contributing to class discussion" (Fredricks, Blumenfeld & Paris, 2004, p. 62). These authors also indicate that there is a positive relation between engagement and academic outcome. Therefore, it is crucial that I examine my own teaching to look at student engagement. Do my students ask questions to learn more? Do they contribute to class discussion? How much effort do they put in for their own learning? are some to the questions that will be addressed in this action research.

# **Bridges to Engagement from Literature**

The three elements of student engagement discussed by Cothran and Ennis (2000) will be further elaborated for consideration in this action research. These three elements of student engagement: (1) communication (2) care and (3) providing active learning opportunities will be taken in as a guide to improve student engagement. It is important that teachers not only communicate with students but also listen to their ideas and opinions, thereby establishing a two-way communication channel. Do I promote two-way communication channels in my classes? Do I listen to my students' ideas and opinions? If not, what do I need to do to establish a two-way communication? Lee (cited in Ravet, 2007, p. 240) comments:

The traditional notion that the adults have the right, sanctioned by society, unilaterally to interpret, direct and control children and their behaviour is one which is under heavy scrutiny in the light of the current reappraisal of pupil rights within the educational sphere and beyond.

In the Bhutanese context, I feel that we still have this traditional notion of adults and teachers being the final authority for knowledge and learning. It is critical that we re-examine our roles in the 21<sup>st</sup> century educational community.

Research by Cothran and Ennis (2000) has shown that students were "willing to engage when they felt the teacher cared if they learned the subject matter and cared about them as a person" (p. 112). Therefore, it is not only important to show care concerning what students have learned but teachers should also be concerned about the students' personal life outside the

class and school. Cothran and Ennis (2000) rightly comment that, "caring teachers appeared to provide a safe, supportive environment in which the students did not feel alone when faced with challenging assignments" (p. 113).

The third key factor in promoting student engagement is the provision of an active learning environment. Again Cothran and Ennis (2000) have found out that students do not like teachers who talk too much and do not provide them opportunities to interact with their friends and with the intellectual work of the class. One of the most important things teachers need to keep in mind while planning for active learning environments are the individual differences of students. All students have their own strengths and weaknesses and they have their own learning styles. It is imperative that teachers try and vary their approaches, including processes of learning, for maximum student engagement. The importance of varying instructional strategies that support student engagement has been discussed by the Center for Comprehensive School Reforms and Improvement (CCSRI 2007). The Centre proposes teachers make use of the following instructional strategies:

- Group activities and assignments;
- Long-term projects;
- Hands-on activities;
- Differentiated instruction; and
- Lessons and activities that draw from students' background, interests, and academic needs (CCSRI 2007, p. 2).

This means that for maximum student engagement teachers need to make sure that there are instructional interventions of various kinds. For example, Pociask and Settles (2007) have found that the use of Howard Gardner's multiple intelligence approaches and cooperative learning challenged students at all levels and significantly improved the level of student engagement. Now that I am aware of all these strategies, I need to find out whether I vary my strategies. However, research has also shown that there is no one particular instructional strategy that creates positive or negative engagement (Setzer, 2006). In summary, Setzer (2006, p. 143) makes a slightly different case than Cothran and Ennis (2000):

Engagement depends upon the activity and how a particular class of students responds to that activity. On average, students responded well to humour used by the teacher, thus positively affecting student engagement as students became more attentive to the teacher.

Knowing students well and using relevant examples in the class were some of the ways that Setzer found were useful for engaging students. This author also suggests that teachers should understand the needs of his or her students, know what instructional activities they were engaged in, and with what activities they become enthused with. For this action research, it is critical to find out the type of activities students prefer and that which are effective, through the base-line data and then plan for the action.

#### **Research Question**

Do effective communication, care, and active learning opportunities promote behavioural and cognitive engagement in pre-service student-teachers in the Curriculum Studies classes?

## Action Plan

This section provides a detailed account of how to go about collecting data and making improvements in this action research. First, only one section of about 30 to 35 final year students will be involved in this action research.

Second, base-line data gathering activity will be conducted in order to understand the trend of student engagement in the researcher's classes with effect from 2<sup>nd</sup> week of August. Survey questionnaires will be administered to all the 35 students and semi-structured interviews will be employed for a sample of 4 students. Selection of 4 samples for interviews will be based on the idea of purposeful sampling (Creswell, 2009; Merriam, 1998). Therefore, 4 samples will have a good representation of gender, ability and representation from different sitting groups in the class. A detailed diary of observations regarding my teaching reflection will be maintained. All these base-line data will provide insights on the existing situation. Pilot test of the questionnaire will be carried out to enhance the reliability of the scales.

Third, after having carefully analysed the situation, alternative plans for improvement will be designed. It is anticipated that student participants will be involved in this process of designing the alternative strategies for student engagement. This task will be completed by the mid September.

Fourth, perhaps by 3<sup>rd</sup> week of September alternative strategies for student engagement will be implemented till the end of October. The impact of these alternative strategies will be monitored through observations, interviews, and a series of reflections. Where relevant, photographs will be taken to provide visual support. This will allow me to obtain a very clear picture of the situation in the class. The idea of a critical friend will be used to observe the lessons, interview the participants and provide critical comments. Based on the outcome of these data and reflections, some changes may need to be incorporated. Intervention strategies to improve upon student engagement will go on till the beginning of November.

Fifth, towards mid November, the intervention data will be gathered using the survey questionnaire from all 35 students in the class and interviews with 4 samples. Intervention data generated will be compared to the base-line data to see if there are any changes in the student engagement in the class.

Sixth, quantitative data gathered through survey questionnaires will be analysed using descriptive statistics such as percentage, mean and standard deviations, whereas interview and observation data will be analysed through developing patterns and themes.

Seventh, Maxwell (2003) discusses about seven alternatives that could take place at the end of a cycle in any action research. First, whether it is successful or not successful, I will stop at the end of a cycle. If it is not successful I will provide further reflection that could lead to another cycle. Second, after a careful reflection I might decide to go back and get more data. Third, it is quite possible that reflection could lead to another question that I may want to pursue. Irrespective of the first cycle being a success or not, now that I have a new question with a different interest it would lead to the second cycle. Fourth, I will have to plan again because

Journal of Educational Action Research

it involves a different problem from the first cycle. Fifth, after careful reflection, I might have to go back to the situational analysis in the reconnaissance to re-consider the literature and the competences in an interactive way. It is important because I might have mis-diagnosed the situation. Sixth, literature review will have to be done again to help conceptualise the new question and provide some good ideas. Often experiences with the first cycle might allow the researcher to ask deeper questions. Seventh, the last option will result from the new area, which would require competency focus. So it is critical that the researcher carefully examines his or her own competencies before starting the next cycle with a new question.

#### Intervention Strategies

Although the type of intervention strategies that will be used in this research will mainly emerge from the base-line data, the researcher will mainly focus on how to build bridges to engagement as discussed in the literature section (Cothran & Ennis, 2000).

#### a. Provision of an active learning environment

An extensive review of related literature indicates that teachers need to provide an active learning environment if they want their students to be engaged cognitively, emotionally and behaviourally in their classes. All classes will be conducted using student-centered approaches to inculcate a sense of democratic procedure in the class. More opportunities will be created for students to interact and learn on their own as well as from their peers. Strategies such as "Think-Pair-Share", "Carousal", "Weaving the Web", "Museum Walk", "3-2-1", "Cooperative Learning", small and large group tasks, and discovery based learning will be initiated.

#### **b.** Communication

As teachers we often tend to forget that teaching is a two-way communication channel. Adopting a one-way communication style will lead to confusion and create gaps in the system. Bhutanese students are not provided adequate opportunities to communicate and express their opinion and concerns. As a result, students loose confidence to communicate with their teachers and peers in the class which actually leads students to disengagement. When students are disengaged not much learning takes place. Therefore, it is significant that teachers find time to pay attention to students and respect their ideas and opinions. In the Bhutanese context, the cultural barrier that was discussed above will have to be overcome. As a part of the intervention strategy I will make sure that students feel free to communicate with the teacher and their peers. They will be invited to share and propose discussions related to the subject as well as share topics related to their personal lives. This will enable them to gain confidence and become open which will ultimately impact upon improving their engagement in the class.

# c. Care

The third bridge to reach for maximum student engagement is the type of care a teacher exhibit for their students. Most teachers display minimum caring attitude for the students. We are well aware that as teachers we often fail to recognise students' needs and concern both at the academic and personal level. So I will consciously model caring and loving qualities both inside and outside the class. Concerns about students' behaviour, their learning opportunities, K. Sherab

reminding them of the important college rules such as their attendance and examinations requirement, discussing about their place of posting after the training, and their life in the college will be practiced throughout the intervention stage.

#### Acknowledgement

I would like to thank the School of Education at the University of New England, in Armidale, Australia for the AusAid Leadership Award, which enabled me to develop this action research proposal. In particular, I would like to extend my gratitude to the Adjunct Professor Tom W. Maxwell for organising the action research course and also for his guidance. The outcome of this action research was published in 2013 by Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group in the Educational Action Research Journal. The paper can be accessed at www.researchgate.net

# References

- Cain, T. & Harris, H. (2013). Teachers' action research in a culture of performativity. *Educational Action Research*, 21(3), 343-358, DOI: 10.1080/09650792.2013.815039
- Carini, R. M, Kuh, G. D, & Klein, S. P. (2006). Student engagement and student learning: Testing the linkages. *Research in Higher Education*, 47(1), 1-32
- Cothran, D. I. & Ennis, C. D. (2000). Building bridges to student engagement: Communicating respect and care for students in urban high schools. *Journal of Research and Development in Education*, 33(2), 106-117.
- Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches* (3rd ed.). Los Angeles: Sage Publications.
- Davies, K., Lambert, H., Turner, A., Jenkins, E., Aston, V., & Rolfe, G. (2014): Making a difference: Using action research to explore our educational practice, *Educational Action Research*, 1-17, DOI: 10.1080/09650792.2013.872575
- Grundy, S. (1995). Action research as professional development. Occasional Paper. No. 1. Canberra: Innovative Links Project AGPS.
- Kemmis, K. (2009). Action research as a practice-based practice. *Educational Action Research*, 17(3), 463-474, DOI: 10.1080/09650790903093284
- Kemmis, S. & McTaggart, R. (2005). Participatory action research: Communicative action and the public sphere. In *The sage handbook of qualitative research*. (3<sup>rd</sup> edition). N.K Denzin and Y.S Lincoln (eds.). California: Sage publications Inc.
- Kuh, G. D. (2001). The national survey of student engagement: Conceptual framework and overview of psychometric properties, 1-26
- Maxwell, T. W. (2003). Action research for Bhutan. *Rabsel the CERD Educational Journal*, 3, 1-20.
- Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Milne, C. & Otieno, T. (2007). Understanding engagement: Science demonstrations and emotional energy. *Wiley Inter Science Periodicals*, 91, 523-553.
- Pociask, A. & Settles, J. (2007). *Increasing student achievement through brain- based strategies. An action project submitted to the graduate faculty of the school of education*

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in teaching and leadership. Chicago, Illinois: St. Xavier University.

- Ravet, J. (2007). Enabling pupil participation in s study of perceptions of disengagement: Methodological matters. *British Journal of Special Education*, 34(4), 234-242.
- Setzer, S. (2006). Engaging the disengaged. In *Studies in teaching: 2006 research digest*. Research projects presented at annual research forum. Leah. P. McCoy (ed.). Winston-Salem NC: Wake Forest University, Department of Education
- Smith, K. A, Sheppard, S. D, Johnson, D. W, & Johnson, R. T. (2005). Pedagogies of engagement: Classroom-based practices. *Journal of Engineering Education*, 87-101
- Stringer, E. (2004). Action research in education. Columbus, Ohio: Pearson Prentice Hall.
- The Centre for Comprehensive School Reform and Improvement. (2007). Using positive student engagement to increase student achievement. *Newsletter*, April 1, 1-4
- Uztosun, M. S., Skinner, N., & Cadorath, J. (2014): An action research study designed to implement student negotiation to improve speaking classroom practice in Turkey, *Educational Action Research*, DOI: 10.1080/09650792.2014.904238
- Willms, J. D. (2003). Student engagement at school: A sense of belonging and participation. Pisa: Organisation for economic development and cooperation.
- Yazzie-Mintz, E. (2006). Voices of students on engagement: A report on the 2006 high school survey of student engagement. Centre for evaluation and education policy: Indiana University.

#### JOURNAL OF EDUCATIONAL ACTION RESEARCH

#### **Guidelines for Manuscript**

The Journal of Educational Action Research (JEAR) is published once a year in Autumn by the Centre for Educational Research and Development, Paro College of Education, Royal University of Bhutan. The JEAR aspires to develop a strong educational research and scholarship culture, through which a systematic, collaborative and participatory process of inquiry can actively seek to address areas of concerns facing education today. This would not only help provide technical skills and specialized knowledge, but also bring about positive changes within the classroom, schools or the community at large. The Journal welcomes contributions from researchers and scholars who work in the field of action research and related activities in education. The JEAR utilizes a blind peer review process of its manuscript and involves both the national and external reviewers.

The authors/contributors are requested to use the instruction below for preparing a manuscript to submit to the *JEAR*.

### **Important Notes for the Contributors**

The JEAR will accept all manuscripts on the condition that the manuscript submitted:

- is your own original work and it is not the duplication of any previously published work, including your own previously published work.
- is currently not under consideration or peer review or accepted for publication or in press or published elsewhere.
- does not contain anything that is defamatory, abusive, fraudulent, libelous or illegal in nature.

All manuscripts considered appropriate for this journal are peer-reviewed. The review process usually takes about one to two months. A copy of the edited paper along with the first proofs will be sent to the author for proofreading. They should be corrected and returned to the Editor within 5 days. Once the final version of the paper has been accepted, authors are requested not to make further changes to the text. The Editor also reserves the right to make any necessary minor changes in the manuscript, or request the author to do so, or reject the manuscript submitted.

#### Manuscript preparation guidelines

- 1. Manuscripts are accepted both in English and Dzongkha (National Language).
- 2. Authors should follow the guidelines in the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association (APA, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition) as a primary reference.
- 3. The length of the manuscript should not exceed 5000 words excluding the title page, abstracts, tables and figures, references, and biographical information.
- 4. Manuscripts should be prepared in the following order: title page (including Acknowledgements as well as Funding and grant-awarding agencies); abstract; keywords; main text; references; appendices (as appropriate); table(s) with caption(s)

(on individual pages); figure caption(s) (as a list).

- 5. The abstract of 150-250 words are required for the manuscripts submitted. The manuscript should also have about 3 to 6 keywords.
- 6. The manuscript should include the author's names, institutional affiliations, mailing addresses, email addresses, telephone and fax numbers on the cover/title page (page separate from the body).
- 7. The manuscripts should be submitted along with a short biographical note. The biographical note should not exceed 150 words.
- 8. All pages should be numbered appropriately in the bottom right corner.
- 9. The use of Endnote and footnote is not encouraged. However, where the use of endnotes is necessary for the manuscript, the effort should be to minimize their number. Endnotes should be placed at the end of the paper immediately before the list of references.
- 10. The Editorial Board reserves the right to reject a manuscript without substantive reasons, if it does not fulfill the manuscript guidelines as specified.

### **Tables and Figures**

- 11. All tables and figures must be numbered in the order by Arabic numerals in which they appear in the manuscript (e.g. Table 1, Table 2). In multi-part tables, each part should be labeled (e.g. Table 1 (a), Table 1 (b)).
- 12. The caption should be provided for each table, figure or symbols. All the figures and tables must be included in the text. The photographs or graphics are also considered as figures.
- 13. A reference to each table or figure should be made in the text. All the measurement units and abbreviation must also be defined appropriately.
- 14. Author must provide the highest quality figure format possible. A highest quality imported or scanned material must be used in the manuscript.
- 15. The Times New Roman Font on all graphics must be used.
- 16. The use of electronic or graphic files must be window-compatible (e.g., BIP, GIF, JPG).
- 17. The author should also on a separate document page submit all the tables, figures or images that are used in the manuscript.
- 18. In the manuscript, if you include any material in which you do not hold copyright, you must obtain written permission from the copyright owner prior to the submission to the JEAR.

# Manuscript submission

- 19. The manuscript should be sent as an e-mail attachment to the Editor in Chief or the Production Editor of the journal at cerd.pce@rub.edu.bt / rameshthapa.pce@ rub.edu.bt
- 20. All manuscript submissions should be in a Word "doc" file or in a Word-compatible file with top, bottom, left and right margins set to one inch, and Times New Roman 12 point font.